PRECIS MINUTES

OF THE

19TH MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE
OF THE PAN AMERICAN SANITARY ORGANIZATION, WORKING PARTY OF THE REGIONAL COMMITTEE OF THE WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION

* Definitive text of the précis minutes, incorporating the provisional texts contained in Documents CE19/19, CE19/20, CE19/21, CE19/22, CE19/24, CE19/26, CE19/27, and CE19/29.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Participants v
Summary of Topics Discussed ix
Précis Minutes:
  First Plenary Session 1
  Second Plenary Session 11
  Third Plenary Session 21
  Fourth Plenary Session 31
  Fifth Plenary Session 41
  Sixth Plenary Session 49
  Seventh Plenary Session 57
  Eighth Plenary Session 67

ANNEXES

ANNEX I: Index to the Précis Minutes
  Part I: Topics of the Agenda
  Part II: Other Matters Considered

ANNEX II: List of Documents Distributed (CE19/0, Rev. 4)
LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Members of the Executive Committee

BRAZIL

Representative

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira Braga
Superintendent of the Special Public Health Service
Caixa Postal 1530
Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

CHILE

Representative

Dr. Oscar Jiménez Pinochet
Undersecretary of Public Health
Ministry of Public Health and Social Welfare
Santiago, Chile

Adviser

Mr. Víctor M. Vergara
Counselor of the Embassy of Chile
1736 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.
Washington 6, D. C.

DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

Representative

Dr. Luis F. Thomen
Ambassador of the Dominican Republic
4500 Sixteenth Street, N.W.
Washington, D. C.

ECUADOR

Representative

Dr. César Vélez Morán
Director General of Public Health
Guayaquil, Ecuador

Alternate

Dr. Juan A. Montalván
Director of the National Institute of Health
Guayaquil, Ecuador
Members of the Executive Committee (Cont'd.)

HAITI

Representative

Dr. Lucien Pierre-Noel
Assistant Director General of Public Health
Port-au-Prince, Haiti

MEXICO

Representative

Dr. José Zozaya
Chief, Office of International Affairs
Ministry of Public Health and Welfare
Mexico City, Mexico

PANAMA

Representative

Dr. Alberto Bissot
Director of Public Health
Ministry of Labor, Welfare, and Public Health
Panama City, Panama

Observers

CUBA

Dr. Félix Hurtado (Observer-Adviser)
Quinta Avenida 124, Miramar
Havana, Cuba

FRANCE

Mr. Gabriel Rosaz
Second Secretary, Embassy of France
2535 Belmont Road, N. W.
Washington, D. C.
Observers (Cont'd.)

NETHERLANDS

Baron C. W. van Boetzelaer
First Secretary, Embassy of the Netherlands
1470 Euclid Street, N. W.
Washington, D. C.

UNITED STATES

Dr. Frederick J. Brady
U. S. Public Health Service
Washington 25, D. C.

Mr. Howard B. Calderwood
Department of State
Washington 25, D. C.

Mr. Simon N. Wilson
Department of State
Washington 25, D. C.

ORGANIZATION OF AMERICAN STATES

Mr. Paul R. Kelbaugh
Chief, Division of Conferences and Organizations
Pan American Union
Washington 6, D. C.

Pan American Sanitary Bureau

Dr. Fred L. Soper, Director
Member ex officio of the Committee

Dr. M. G. Candau, Assistant Director
Alternate

Dr. Miguel E. Bustamante, Secretary General
Secretary of the Committee

Advisers:

Dr. Emilio Budnik
Dr. P. P. de Caires
Dr. Oswaldo Costa
Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Cont'd.)

Advisers: (Cont'd.)

Dr. Kenneth O. Courtney
Dr. Stanford F. Farnsworth
Mr. Harry A. Hinderer
Mr. Clarence Moore
Dr. Guillermo Samame
Dr. Oswaldo J. da Silva
Dr. Myron Wegman

Press Officer:

Mr. Harold Ballou

Conference Officer:

Mr. Guillermo A. Suro
SUMMARY OF TOPICS DISCUSSED

First Plenary Session (Monday, 20 April 1953, at 9:50 a.m.) 1

1. **Topic 1:** Opening by the Provisional Chairman, Dr. José Zozaya (Mexico) 3

2. **Topic 2:** Election of Chairman and Vice-Chairman 3

3. **Topic 3:** Adoption of the Agenda (Document CE19/1, Rev. 1) 3

4. Oral Report by the Director on Recent Bureau Activities 4

5. Nomination of Dr. M.G. Candau for the Post of Director-General of the World Health Organization 6

6. **Topic 3:** Adoption of the Agenda (Document CE19/1, Rev. 1) (Conclusion) 7

7. Order of Business 7

8. **Topic 14:** Resolution concerning Medical Care, Adopted by the V Conference of American States Members of the International Labor Organization (Document CE19/3) 8

9. **Topic 11:** Third Report of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution of the Pan American Sanitary Organization (Document CE19/15) 9

Second Plenary Session (Monday, 20 April 1953, at 2:40 p.m.) 11

10. **Topic 9:** Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization (Document CE19/13) 13


12. **Topic 6:** Draft Regulations on the Promotion of Personnel from within the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/9) 17

13. Meetings of the Working Parties 18
Third Plenary Session (Wednesday, 22 April 1953, at 9:55 a.m.)

   (Conclusion)  
   Page 23

15. **Topic 10**: First Report of the Permanent Subcommittee on Buildings and Installations (Document CE19/11)  
   Page 26

16. **Topic 12**: Relations between the Pan American Sanitary Organization and Non-Governmental Organizations (Document CE19/4)  
   Page 26

17. **Topic 8**: Amendments to the Staff Rules of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/6)  
   Page 28

Fourth Plenary Session (Wednesday, 22 April 1953, at 2:50 p.m.)

18. **Topic 8**: Amendments to the Staff Rules of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/6) (Conclusion)  
   Page 33

19. **Topic 7**: Remuneration of the International Staff Members of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/8)  
   Page 35

20. **Topic 15**: Repayment of Loans to the Rockefeller and Kellogg Foundations (Document CE19/5)  
   Page 36

21. **Topic 16**: Status of Cuota Contributions (Document CE19/16)  
   Page 38

22. **Topic 13**: Inter-American Medical Congresses (Document CE19/17)  
   Page 39

Fifth Plenary Session (Thursday, 23 April 1953, at 3:00 p.m.)

23. Medical Meeting at Richmond, Virginia  
   Page 43

24. **Topic 17**: Amendments to the Financial Regulations of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/7)  
   Page 43

25. **Topic 18**: Dates of the 20th and 21st Meetings of the Executive Committee and VII Meeting of the Directing Council (Document CE19/12)  
   Page 45
Fifth Plenary Session (Continued)

26. **Topic 19:** Method of Work of the Directing Council
   (Document CE19/14)

Sixth Plenary Session (Friday, 24 April 1953, at 10:25 a.m.)

27. **Topic 4:** Proposed Program and Budget of the Pan American
   Sanitary Bureau for 1954 (Document CE19/2)
   Report of Working Party I (Program and Budget)
   (Document CE19/23)

Seventh Plenary Session (Friday, 24 April 1953, at 3:20 p.m.)

28. **Topic 4:** Proposed Program and Budget of the Pan American
   Sanitary Bureau for 1954 (Document CE19/2)
   (Conclusion)
   Report of Working Party I (Program and Budget)
   (Document CE19/23, Rev. 1) (Conclusion)

29. **Topic 5:** Financial Report of the Director and Report of
   the External Auditor for 1952 (Document CE19/10)
   (Conclusion)
   Report of Working Party II (Financial Report of
   the Director and Report of the External Auditor)
   (Document CE19/25) (Conclusion)

30. Attendance of the American States at the Sixth World Health
    Assembly

31. Votes of Thanks and Message to Dr. César Vélez Morán

Eighth Plenary Session (Monday, 27 April 1953, at 4:30 p.m.)

32. Reading and Approval of the Final Report (Document CE19/28)

33. Closing Speech by the Chairman of the 19th Meeting of the
    Executive Committee
PREGIS MINUTES OF THE FIRST PLENARY SESSION
Washington, D. C.,
Monday, 20 April 1953, at 9:50 a.m.

Provisional Chairman: Dr. José ZOZAYA Mexico
Chairman: Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN Ecuador
Vice-Chairman: Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA Brazil
Secretary: Dr. Miguel E. BUSTAMANTE Pan American Sanitary Bureau

SUMMARY

1. Topic 1: Opening by the Provisional Chairman, Dr. José Zozaya (Mexico)
2. Topic 2: Election of Chairman and Vice-Chairman
3. Topic 3: Adoption of the Agenda (Document CE19/1, Rev. 1)
4. Oral Report by the Director on Recent Bureau Activities
5. Nomination of Dr. M. G. Candau for the Post of Director-General of the World Health Organization
6. Topic 3: Adoption of the Agenda (Document CE19/1, Rev. 1) (Conclusion)
7. Order of Business
8. Topic 14: Resolution concerning Medical Care, Adopted by the Fifth Conference of American States Members of the International Labor Organization (Document CE19/3)
PRESENT:

Members:

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA  
Brazil
Dr. Oscar JIMENEZ PINOCHET  
Chile
Dr. Luis F. THOMÉN  
Dominican Republic
Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN  
Ecuador
Dr. Lucien PIERRE-NOEL  
Haiti
Dr. José ZOZAYA  
Mexico
Dr. Alberto BISSOT  
Panama
Dr. Fred L. SOPER (ex officio)  
Pan American Sanitary Bureau
Dr. M. G. CANDAU

Other Participants:

Governments:

Dr. Félix HURTADO, Observer-Adviser  
Cuba
Mr. Gabriel ROSAZ, Observer  
France
Baron C. W. VAN BOETZELAER, Observer  
Netherlands
Mr. Howard B. CALDERWOOD, Observer  
United States
Mr. Simon N. WILSON

Inter-Governmental Organizations:

Mr. Paul R. KELBAUGH  
Organization of American States (OAS)
1. **TOPIC 1: OPENING BY THE PROVISIONAL CHAIRMAN, DR. JOSE ZOZAYA (MEXICO)**

The Provisional Chairman, Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico), opened the 19th Meeting of the Executive Committee.

2. **TOPIC 2: ELECTION OF CHAIRMAN AND VICE-CHAIRMAN**

The PROVISIONAL CHAIRMAN called for nominations for the office of Chairman.

Dr. MONTALVAN (Ecuador) nominated the Representative of the Dominican Republic.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) regretfully declined the nomination because of his numerous duties and, in turn, nominated the Representative of Ecuador.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) seconded the nomination.

**DECISION TAKEN**

The Representative of Ecuador was unanimously elected Chairman.

Dr. BISSOT (Panama) nominated the Representative of Brazil for Vice-Chairman.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) seconded the nomination.

**DECISION TAKEN**

The Representative of Brazil was unanimously elected Vice-Chairman.

Dr. MONTALVAN (Ecuador) then took the Chair and expressed his appreciation for this honor. He stated that, drawing upon his experience in public health, he would make every effort to perform his duties well.

3. **TOPIC 3: ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA (Document CE19/1, Rev. 1)**

The SECRETARY gave an explanation concerning the documents that had been distributed to the Representatives. He added that the document dealing with Topic 13 (Inter-American Medical Congresses) would be distributed the following day.
Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) referred to the order in which the topics of the Agenda were to be discussed, proposing that other topics be examined before the consideration of the Proposed Program and Budget for 195_, which would require considerable study. He suggested that the Director be asked to summarize the most important matters with which the Bureau has had to deal during the past six months.

4. ORAL REPORT BY THE DIRECTOR ON RECENT BUREAU ACTIVITIES

The CHAIRMAN invited Dr. Soper to present the statement requested by the Representative of Mexico.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) pointed out that, although it is not customary to present the report of the activities of the Bureau at this time, he was in agreement with the suggestion of the Representative of Mexico. He felt that it would be very worth while to mention certain important items. As the Zone Representatives and principal officers of the Bureau were present, the Members of the Executive Committee would be able to obtain information directly from them. He suggested that the Members of the Committee, especially those newly elected, visit the two Headquarters buildings of the Bureau, on this or the following day, in order to observe the manner in which it operates.

Dr. Soper stated that the Bureau has recently had to face an unusual situation, owing to the decrease in United Nations Technical Assistance funds, which are used to finance a great many of the projects of the Bureau. Late in 1952 and early in 1953 information was received that the Technical Assistance funds assigned to the specialized agencies would be less than the amounts needed to cover the commitments at first anticipated by these agencies. At its January meeting, the Executive Board of the World Health Organization recognized for the first time that it is actually the Technical Assistance Board of the United Nations that determines, to a large extent, the execution of the public health programs. This reduction in funds has created a difficult situation and necessitated a review of the number and scope of the programs.

The Director then spoke of the advisory services that are offered by the Zone Offices and Representatives in the various countries.

He also mentioned meetings held by the various Subcommittees of the Organization, and discussed the Bureau's collaboration with other international organizations, with which a greater coordination of activities is being achieved.

He then took up specific public health problems. He referred to the epidemic of jungle yellow fever reported in the State of São Paulo (Brazil) during the months of November to March, and described the vaccination program that was carried out there on an unprecedented scale. The spread of the disease has been reported to the south of the zone affected last year.
Dr. Soper spoke of the cases of yellow fever reported in Nicaragua, near the Honduran border, and, referring to other regions, cited the cases that occurred several days ago in Muso, Colombia.

The Director recalled that the new International Sanitary Regulations now in effect are of great importance to the program for eradication of the Aedes aegypti. Article 70 deals with the delineation of yellow-fever endemic zones and yellow-fever receptive areas by the World Health Organization in consultation with the Governments concerned.

Dr. Soper then discussed the program for the eradication of yaws in Haiti, stating that the reports received confirm the effectiveness of the dosage of penicillin that is being used in this campaign.

The Director pointed out that the Executive Board of the World Health Organization has decided to place before the Assembly the nomination of Dr. Candau, Assistant Director of the Bureau, for the office of Director-General of the World Health Organization. He mentioned how difficult it would be to replace Dr. Candau.

He then took up other problems: those caused by the new procedure of investigating United States citizens prior to their employment. This procedure, he felt, causes an additional delay in the carrying out of programs, especially as regards recruiting persons for short-term programs.

Finally, the Director made brief mention of the recent meeting of the National Citizens' Committee for the World Health Organization, which sought to promote public interest throughout the United States in the work of the WHO.

The CHAIRMAN said that he had followed the report of the Director with great interest and asked the Members of the Committee if they wished to make any comments.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) expressed his satisfaction with the report of the Director.

The CHAIRMAN commented briefly on the statements of the Director and stressed particularly the importance to the Bureau of the reduction in Technical Assistance funds. He spoke of the interest that Dr. Soper had always shown in programs for the eradication of yellow fever, and urged the Members who will attend the meeting in Geneva to bear in mind the information furnished by the Director. Referring to the problems that arose in connection with the investigation required prior to the employment of United States citizens, the Chairman suggested that the difficulties might be overcome by endeavoring to employ, whenever possible, citizens from other countries of the Americas.
5. NOMINATION OF DR. M. G. CANDAU FOR THE POST OF DIRECTOR-GENERAL OF THE WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION

The CHAIRMAN then expressed his pleasure at the selection of Dr. Candau as candidate for the office of Director-General of the World Health Organization, saying that the news had been received with great satisfaction by everyone, particularly in public health circles in the Americas and in the Pan American Sanitary Bureau. He suggested that a resolution be adopted to express the pleasure of the Members of the Committee.

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) described the manner in which Dr. Candau had been selected as a candidate by the WHO Executive Board, explaining the position of the Chairman of the Board, who had been a possible candidate. Dr. Hurtado was pleased to inform the Committee that the candidacy of Dr. Candau had been confirmed by more Members of the Board than had originally supported his selection, and he suggested that the Executive Committee urge the American delegations attending the World Health Assembly to give unanimous support to Dr. Candau's appointment.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) also expressed great pleasure at the selection of Dr. Candau, although he felt it was unnecessary for the Executive Committee to make any recommendation to the Governments, as they would support his appointment in any event. Moreover, he feared that such a procedure might set an undesirable precedent. Dr. Thomen supported the proposal of the Chairman, believing that the vote of satisfaction could be given with the other votes of thanks, at the end of the meeting, as is customary.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that the appointment of the Director-General of the World Health Organization is, to some extent, a policy matter, and he recalled that the Executive Committee acts as working party of the WHO Regional Committee.

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) reiterated his statements in praise and support of the candidacy of Dr. Candau, and recalled that the Executive Committee, although it is composed of only seven Members, represents the Pan American Sanitary Organization.

The CHAIRMAN explained that his proposal was intended solely to convey the great satisfaction felt at the selection of Dr. Candau. He proposed that the expression of satisfaction be approved at the present session and that the formal vote be presented with the other votes of thanks that are customarily approved at the end of the meeting.

DECISION TAKEN

It was unanimously agreed to express, in the manner proposed by the Chairman, the pleasure and satisfaction of the Executive Committee at the selection of Dr. Candau.  

See Final Report of the 19th Meeting of the Executive Committee (Document CE19/28, Rev. 1), Resolution XVIII.
6. **TOPIC 3: ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA (Document CE19/1, Rev.1) (Conclusion)**

The CHAIRMAN then submitted the Draft Agenda of the Meeting (Document CE19/1, Rev. 1), proposing that it be approved but that there be an exchange of views before the Committee decided on the order in which the topics were to be considered.

**DECISION TAKEN**

The Draft Agenda was approved and it was agreed to follow the procedure suggested by the Chairman.

7. **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

The CHAIRMAN proposed that a recess of several minutes be called to enable the Representatives to exchange views before deciding on the order in which the topics of the Agenda were to be discussed.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) proposed that a working party of three members be appointed to study the Proposed Program and Budget for 1954.

A recess was called at 11:20 a.m. and the session was resumed at 11:50 a.m.

The CHAIRMAN stated that there were two points before the Committee, namely, the order in which the Agenda topics were to be discussed and the appointment of a working party to study the Proposed Program and Budget. With regard to the first point, he suggested that the Committee begin by discussing Topic 14 (Resolution concerning medical care, adopted by the Fifth Conference of American States Members of the International Labor Organization), Topic 11 (Third Report of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution), Topic 9 (Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization), and then proceed to discuss the remaining topics in the order in which they appear on the Agenda, with the exception of the Proposed Program and Budget.

**DECISION TAKEN**

The proposal of the Chairman was approved.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) referred to his proposal concerning the appointment of a working party to study the Proposed Program and Budget for 1954, stating that the matter could be dealt with more quickly and effectively if the three members had a working knowledge of the previous budgets of the Organization.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) supported this view.
DECISION TAKEN

The proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic was unanimously approved.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) pointed out that the Chairman had authority to appoint the members of the working party.

The CHAIRMAN then proposed that the working party be composed of the Representatives of Brazil, the Dominican Republic, and Mexico.

DECISION TAKEN

It was so agreed.

The CHAIRMAN suggested that a time schedule be established for the sessions, and at the proposal of Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) it was agreed to hold sessions from 9:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m., and from 2:30 p.m. to 5:30 p.m.

The CHAIRMAN further proposed that the visit of the Members of the Executive Committee to the Headquarters buildings of the Bureau take place on Tuesday morning, 21 April, and that the morning session be suspended for this purpose.

This proposal was approved.

8. TOPIC 14: RESOLUTION CONCERNING MEDICAL CARE, ADOPTED BY THE FIFTH CONFERENCE OF AMERICAN STATES MEMBERS OF THE INTERNATIONAL LABOR ORGANIZATION (Document CE19/3)

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/3 on the above topic.

Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHET (Chile) said that all the Representatives would be agreeable to calling the attention of their respective Governments to the proposals contained in the resolution attached to Document CE19/3. He recalled that the Government of Chile has recently enacted legislation designed to reorganize the public health and social security services of the country, and that it has accumulated much experience and compiled much information on this subject over a period of 25 years, which it wished to place at the disposal of the Governments of the other American Republics as a contribution toward the improvement of these services.

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) urged that any decisions on this subject also take into account the medical profession, with a view to coordinating the interests of the medical group with general interests in social security systems.
The CHAIRMAN stated that the resolution adopted by the Fifth Conference of American States Members of the International Labor Organization reflects an aim of social security in the various countries. He suggested that this resolution be transmitted to the Regional Committee of the World Health Organization with a statement on the interests of the medical profession referred to by the Observer for Cuba.

Dr. JIMENEZ PINCCHET (Chile) supported the views of the Observer for Cuba, and pointed out that in Chile the protection afforded the worker takes into account the interests of the medical profession.

DECISION TAKEN

It was unanimously agreed to transmit to the Regional Committee of the World Health Organization (Directing Council of the PASO) the resolution in Document CE19/3 (Annex I), together with a statement of the views regarding the medical profession expressed in the course of the discussion. 2/


The CHAIRMAN invited Dr. Thomen, Chairman of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution, to report briefly on the status of the Committee's work.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) reported that the Permanent Committee had held several meetings but that it had been unable to complete its task, which is somewhat complex. Subsequently the Directing Council and the Pan American Sanitary Conference will have to rule on this matter. He said that the report on the work accomplished by the Permanent Committee was being presented merely for purposes of information.

The SECRETARY then read the Third Report of the Permanent Committee (Document CE19/15).

The CHAIRMAN thanked Dr. Thomen for his explanation and pointed out that the Permanent Committee had been unable to complete its task owing to the fact that several Governments have not yet expressed their opinions on the matter. He suggested that the Permanent Committee continue its work until it receives the opinions of all the Member Governments and is able to present its own preliminary draft of the revised Constitution.

2/ Ibid., Resolution XI.
DECISION TAKEN

The Third Report of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution (Document CE19/15) was unanimously approved, with an expression of appreciation to the members of the Permanent Committee. 2

The CHAIRMAN proposed that at the afternoon session the Committee consider Topic 9 (Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization), Topic 5 (Financial Report of the Director and Report of the External Auditor for 1952), and Topic 6 (Draft Regulations on the Promotion of Personnel from within the Pan American Sanitary Bureau).

It was so agreed.

The session was adjourned at 12:30 p.m.

3/Ibid., Resolution III (revised at the Closing Plenary Session).
PRECIS MINUTES OF THE SECOND PLENARY SESSION
Washington, D. C.
Monday, 20 April 1953, at 2:40 p.m.

Chairman: Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN Ecuador
Vice-Chairman: Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA Brazil
Secretary: Dr. Miguel E. BUSTAMANTE Pan American Sanitary Bureau

SUMMARY

10. **Topic 9**: Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization (Document CE19/13)


12. **Topic 6**: Draft Regulations on the Promotion of Personnel from within the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/9)

13. Meetings of the Working Parties
PRESENT:

Members:

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA Brazil
Dr. Oscar JIMENEZ PINOCHET Chile
Mr. Victor M. VERCARA
Dr. Luis F. THOMEN
Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN
Dr. Lucien PIERRE-NOEL
Dr. José ZOZAYA
Dr. Alberto BISSOT
Dr. Fred L. SOPER (ex officio)
Dr. M. G. CANDAU

Other Participants:

Governments:

Dr. Félix HURTADO, Observer-Adviser Cuba
Mr. Gabriel ROSAZ, Observer France
Barrn C. W. VAN BOETZELAER, Observer Netherlands
Mr. Howard B. CALDERWOOD, Observer United States

Inter-Governmental Organizations:

Mr. Paul R. KELBAUGH Organization of American States (OAS)

Pan American Sanitary Bureau (PASB):

Mr. Harry A. HINDERER, Chief, Division of Administration
10. **TOPIC 9: INTERIM REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIES AND DECENTRALIZATION** (Document CE19/13)

The CHAIRMAN stated that the Agenda topic to be discussed was the Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) requested that the study of this topic be postponed, since Dr. Brady, Member of that Committee and Observer for the United States to the Executive Committee, was absent.

The CHAIRMAN submitted the proposal of the Representative of Mexico for a decision.

**DECISION TAKEN**

It was agreed to postpone discussion of Topic 9 on the Agenda.


Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) pointed out that this was a strictly financial topic and therefore Mr. Hinderer, Chief of the Division of Administration, was the one qualified to present it and to reply to any comments.

Mr. HINDERER (Chief, Division of Administration, PASB) explained that the document contains the Financial Report of the Director and the Report of the External Auditor, prepared pursuant to Article 12 of the Financial Regulations. In his opinion, the Executive Committee should study the comments made by the External Auditor and also the explanatory statements on his comments. Mr. Hinderer explained that, although there was an apparent overdraft on the bank account, this overdraft appeared on the books of the Bureau only because checks dated 31 December 1952 continued to be drawn until the end of January 1953. He likewise pointed out the Auditor's recommendation that the current agreements between the Pan American Union and the Pan American Sanitary Bureau be abrogated, for they give rise to a divided responsibility between the Treasurer of the Union and the Finance Officer of the Bureau; he offered the information that negotiations are under way and letters have already been exchanged, but no definite agreement has yet been reached.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) asked what the reaction of the Auditor was to the overdraft resulting from the issuance of checks.
Mr. HINDERER (Chief, Division of Administration, PASB) reported that the Auditor felt obliged to include this matter in his Report, but there was no real overdraft, since it was merely an accounting matter.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that the person who serves as External Auditor for the Pan American Sanitary Bureau performs the same function for the World Health Organization, to enable him to evaluate conditions as a whole, and stated that the overdraft was not due to any mishandling of funds.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) felt that it was nothing more than an accounting operation, about which he was not qualified to judge; what he wanted to know was whether such a procedure was acceptable from an accounting viewpoint. He believed that the Executive Committee would have to consult the Auditor on this point. He considered it highly desirable for the Bureau to employ the same External Auditor as the World Health Organization, then he referred to the loan to the WHO, an operation that seemed to him more acceptable because it was, in his opinion, a banking procedure, but on that, too, he would like to know the Auditor's opinion.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) agreed with the comments of the Representative of the Dominican Republic, and added that the Auditor stated in point 9 that there is no valid excuse for the existence of an overdraft on the bank account. With respect to the use of Pan American Sanitary Bureau funds to cover costs of projects of the World Health Organization, he believed that there should be some concrete authorization from the Executive Committee. On page 40 the Auditor makes some comments on staff changes, which, in his opinion, are very important, and he points out the danger that such changes involve. Dr. Zozaya went on to say that the Auditor refers to important matters in his Report, as, for example, when he mentions on page 40 the divided responsibility between the Treasurer of the Pan American Union and the Finance Officer of the Bureau; on page 41, paragraph (c), the overinvestment of funds; in the next paragraph the financial implications of the investments; and finally, on page 43, point 14, the inventories. For these reasons Dr. Zozaya believed that it would be interesting for the Executive Committee to learn the main reasons for the Auditor's comments.

The CHAIRMAN said that, in view of the Representatives' interest in the Report of the External Auditor, he would like to know if the members of the Executive Committee were now sufficiently informed on this matter, if they wished to present individual comments on the document, or if they preferred to have a working party assigned to study the matter and present a report to the Committee.

Mr. HINDERER (Chief, Division of Administration, PASB) stated that the situation referred to in the first paragraph of page 41 of the Report will not arise again, once the Bureau can handle its own funds, and as for the inventories, he added that the Bureau has control over the equipment it provides, a control based on the standard procedures it has prepared.
Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) wished to make it clear that the Pan American Sanitary Bureau is not subject to the same budgetary rules as the World Health Organization. The funds that the PASB fails to disburse in a given year are not automatically lost, as happens with the WHO. With reference to the checks issued in January 1953 and dated 31 December 1952, he said that this fact was due to strictly administrative delays.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) said that he would mention only the comments made by the External Auditor himself, whose opinion he accepted when it came to questions of accounting. He proposed that the study of this topic be postponed, and that a working party of three members be appointed to study the Report of the External Auditor.

The CHAIRMAN laid the proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic before the Committee.

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) considered Dr. Thomen's proposal very pertinent, but believed it necessary to make some remarks to guide the working party that would be appointed. The Report is signed by an expert accountant, who serves the WHO in the same capacity, but who did not present the usual concrete conclusions at the end of his report, since the final point (15) contains no reference to his earlier comments. The question therefore arises, with respect to point 8 (b), whether the Auditor was fully satisfied when he was furnished the documents on the transfer of funds from the PASB to the WHO, or whether those documents were ever furnished him. The question also arises whether the Auditor believed the procedure set forth in point 8 (c) was economically correct. Nevertheless, he said in point 9 that there is no valid excuse for the existence of an overdraft on the bank account, but he does not give any detailed explanation of the matter. Dr. Hurtado added that the Auditor gives a well-founded criticism of the financial relations with the Pan American Union, which both collects the quotas and is treasurer of the PASB. Mr. Hinderer had pointed out the anomalies of this administrative procedure, which the Executive Committee should rectify. In conclusion, the Observer for Cuba believed that the Executive Committee should approve the Report of the Auditor and then, after taking his comments and advice into account, apply such measures as are appropriate.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) wished to make it clear that he did not for a moment believe that there had been an improper handling of funds and he concurred with the analysis of Dr. Hurtado, who had offered a constructive criticism, and in so doing had called attention to the final point
in the Auditor's report, which might be called protocolary, for it says nothing. Dr. Thomen believed that the Executive Committee should discuss in detail the comments made by the Auditor and adopt measures thereon to prevent the occurrence or a future repetition of such shortcomings. While it is true that the Bureau has had to operate under abnormal conditions, he recognized the fact that it is the most efficient organization in international health work. It is natural, he said, that its growth should give rise to difficulties, but it is essential that all procedures be normal and correct from an administrative point of view. The Auditor should find nothing to criticize in the future activities of the Bureau, he added, and urged the appointment of a working party.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) expressed his agreement with the general ideas set forth by the Representative of the Dominican Republic. In general, an auditor's report is accepted a priori, because of its technical nature. Seldom has there been an auditor's report with such specific comments. He agreed that a working party should be named.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) was not in accord with the proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic. While he approved the creation of a working party to study the Budget, which is very full and detailed, he felt that the Report of the Auditor, being much shorter, might well be studied by each of the Representatives. The pertinent resolution could then be adopted in plenary session.

The CHAIRMAN explained that the Executive Committee cannot adopt a resolution on a document that has not been read in its entirety, or without a committee report.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) said, in that case, since the Report of the Auditor, properly speaking, consists of only a few pages, it could be read in full in plenary session.

Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHET (Chile) agreed with the view of the Representative of Brazil.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) raised a point of order. There was a proposal that had been seconded and therefore should be voted upon.

The CHAIRMAN declared the discussion closed, and put Dr. Thomen's proposal, that a working party of three members be appointed to study Topic 5 of the Agenda and report to the Committee, to a vote.

DECISION TAKEN

A roll-call vote was taken:

Affirmative votes: Dominican Republic, Haiti, Mexico, Panama.
Negative votes: Brazil, Chile.

By a vote of four to two, the proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic was approved.

12. **TOPIC 6: DRAFT REGULATIONS ON THE PROMOTION OF PERSONNEL FROM WITHIN THE PAN AMERICAN SANITARY BUREAU (Document CE19/9)**

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/9.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) pointed out that the staff of the PASB works under the same conditions as does the staff of the WHO. He recalled that at Ciudad Trujillo a subcommittee was appointed to study certain variants proposed for the Staff Rules of the PASB, and that the said subcommittee recommended that the rules be uniform with those of the WHO. He made the observation that the Staff Rules of the PASB are in large part identical with those of the WHO, and that the latter, in turn, reflect those in force in the United Nations. As he understood it, the present Staff Rules of the PASB contain adequate provisions for the promotion of the staff and reflect the recommendations contained in Resolution XIII of the VI Meeting of the Directing Council. But he insisted on the necessity of having the higher posts, such as Zone Representatives, filled by persons who are in agreement with the policies, since otherwise he could not assume the responsibility for any decentralized services.

The CHAIRMAN recalled that the Directing Council requested that draft regulations on the promotion of personnel from within the Bureau be prepared for presentation at the 19th Meeting of the Executive Committee.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) agreed with the Director's statement and pointed out that the higher posts should be filled by persons in whom the Director has confidence.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) also concurred in the remarks of the Director and indicated that the question of promotion of personnel has already been solved in the current Staff Rules, which are analogous to those of other international organizations. He thought it evident that any one who is to apply a general policy should be thoroughly familiar with it and also have the confidence of the Director, and added he considered it absolutely essential that such confidence should not exclude other abilities required of a staff member under consideration.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) voiced his agreement with Dr. Soper's remarks, but requested an explanation of the differences set forth on page 3 on *extra allowances to staff members who are proficient in several languages.*
Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) explained that this system was based on purely practical and administrative considerations, inasmuch as a staff member having a knowledge of two Latin languages is less valuable to the Bureau than one having the knowledge of one Latin language in addition to English.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) expressed his satisfaction with the Director's explanation and added that in his opinion any staff member whose mother tongue was Spanish and who learned Portuguese, or vice versa, was entitled to be rewarded for his effort.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) felt that it was not necessary to prepare any regulations on the promotion of personnel from within the Bureau, and proposed that the opinion of the Director of the PASB be accepted.

The CHAIRMAN then added that the opinion of the Executive Committee should be transmitted to the Directing Council.

DECISION TAKEN

The proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic was unanimously approved.

The meeting was recessed at 5:00 p.m. and resumed 10 minutes later.

The SECRETARY informed the Representatives of the scheduled visit and the working program for the following day.

13. MEETINGS OF THE WORKING PARTIES

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) then inquired as to how the activities of the working party on the Budget would be organised.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) thought this was an open working party, at which all the Representatives on the Executive Committee could voice their opinions, but that as regards the plenary sessions, he considered it preferable to give it sufficient time for its work and that it should have the next afternoon available.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) thought that the working party on the Budget could not finish its task that afternoon and agreed with Dr. Zozaya that it should continue its work on Tuesday. He likewise felt that the working party on the Financial Report would need ample time for its study, since the matter in question required careful consideration, in which no detail should be omitted and no point neglected. He stated that

4/Ibid., Resolution VI.
although the Report should be temperate and comprehensive, since any resolution arrived at could not fail to recognize the fact that there had been shortcomings, which, although justified by circumstances, should not recur, but such resolution should not minimize the value of the financial task performed.

The CHAIRMAN stated that he understood the majority were inclined to accept the following working plan: The morning of the 21st would be devoted to a visit to the Bureau headquarters and the afternoon to the meetings of the working parties. The Executive Committee will meet again in plenary session in the morning of 22 April.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) inquired which members had been assigned to the working party on the Financial Report.

The CHAIRMAN said it was composed of the Representatives of Chile, Haiti and Panama.

The meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.
PRELIMINARY MINUTES OF THE THIRD PLENARY SESSION
Washington, D. C.
Wednesday, 22 April 1953, at 9:55 a.m.

Chairman: Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN
Ecuador
Vice-Chairman: Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA
Brazil
Secretary: Dr. Miguel E. BUSTAMANTE
Pan American Sanitary Bureau

SUMMARY

14. **Topic 9**: Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization (Document CE19/13) (Conclusion)

15. **Topic 10**: First Report of the Permanent Subcommittee on Buildings and Installations (Document CE19/11)

16. **Topic 12**: Relations between the Pan American Sanitary Organization and Non-Governmental Organizations (Document CE19/4)

17. **Topic 7**: Amendments to the Staff Rules of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/6)
PRESENT:

Members:

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA
Brazil
Dr. Oscar JIMENEZ PINOCHET
Chile
Dr. Luis F. THOMEN
Dominican Republic
Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN
Ecuador
Dr. Lucien PIERRE-NOEL
Haiti
Dr. José ZOZAYA
Mexico
Dr. Alberto BISSOT
Panama
Dr. Fred L. SOPER (ex officio)
Pan American
Dr. M. G. CANDAU
Sanitary Bureau

Other Participants:

Governments:

Dr. Félix HURTADO, Observer-Adviser
Cuba
Mr. Gabriel ROSAZ, Observer
France
Baron C. W. VAN BOETZELAER, Observer
Netherlands
Dr. Frederick J. BRADY, Observer
United States
Mr. Howard B. CALDERWOOD
Mr. Simon N. WILSON

Inter-Governmental Organizations:

Mr. Paul R. KELBAUGH
Organization of American States (OAS)

Pan American Sanitary Bureau (PASB):

Mr. Harry A. HINDERER, Chief, Division of Administration
TOPIC 9: INTERIM REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIES AND DECENTRALIZATION (Document CE19/13) (Conclusion)


The SECRETARY read Document CE19/13 on this topic.

The CHAIRMAN invited Dr. Zozaya, Chairman of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization, to comment upon the report.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) pointed out that the report was merely preliminary and therefore open to any comments or criticisms that the Members of the Committee might wish to make. He said that, in agreement with the Director of the Bureau, a meeting had been held with the Zone Representatives. He then requested the Executive Committee to authorize the expenditures proposed by the Committee for the continuation of its study.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) asked Dr. Zozaya to give additional details concerning the manner in which the funds requested by his Committee would be expended.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) explained that the proposed expenditures covered the cost of the visit to all the Zone Offices by the three members of the Committee, as well as the travel expenses and per diem of the adviser to be provided by the United States Public Health Service and those of a Latin American accountant who will study administrative and financial problems of the Zones.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) considered the Committee's report to be of great value and its program of future activities a good one. He proposed that the Executive Committee approve the proposed expenditures, and that it commend the Committee for the work accomplished and urge it to continue with its task in the same efficient manner.

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) concurred in the praise expressed by the Representative of the Dominican Republic, but felt that the Committee on Economies and Decentralization had confined itself to presenting an outline plan without defining specific projects or objectives, and no doubt to the fact that it is merely a preliminary report. He spoke of the fact that in the budget of the Bureau there appeared to be a disproportion in the funds assigned to the three main branches of the Organization's activities, which are the responsibility of the Division of Administration, the Division of Public Health, and the Division of Education and Training, respectively.
In the distribution of funds, preference should be given to the education and training services.

Dr. Hurtado went on to say that, in the field of education and training, there should be greater co-ordination of the technical and the academic activities of public health schools throughout the Americas. He stressed the importance of the fellowship program, and spoke also of the need for a review of the activities of the Zone Offices.

The speaker believed that the members of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization should decide upon specific objectives before undertaking their visit to the Zone Offices. It will require a long time to carry out the future program described in the Committee's Report, and for this reason the Committee may not be in a position to present its findings at the next meeting of the Executive Committee.

The CHAIRMAN also believed the Report to be very valuable, even though the Committee could do little more than present an outline of its future work. He suggested that the Executive Committee consider approval of the proposed expenditures for the continuation of the Committee's work.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) recalled that when the Directing Council decided to establish this Committee, he maintained that its function should be to study the possibility of reducing expenditures at Headquarters in Washington and increasing the funds allocated to field programs. He said that it is difficult to effect economies and decentralize the activities of the PASB at the same time. He supported the proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic, believing it advisable for the Members of the Committee to view at first hand the operations of the Zone Offices.

Dr. JIMÉNEZ PINOCHET (Chile) said that before coming to this Meeting, he had made a study of the Budgets of the PASB and the WHO, in order to compare the proportions allocated to Headquarters expenses and to field activities by the two Organizations. Similarly, he studied the proportions of the two Budgets allocated to technical activities and to administrative services. The speaker said that economies should not be taken to mean a reduction of the budget from six million to four million dollars, but rather a more effective utilization of available funds in order to achieve maximum results. He considered it advisable for the Committee to continue its work in the interest of bringing about the greatest possible efficiency in the activities of the Bureau.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) recalled that the Committee had been instructed to study, on the basis of the present organization of the Bureau, the possibility of effecting economies and further decentralizing activities, as
had been held desirable at the Havana Meeting. He was in agreement with the Committee's report and supported the proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic. Finally, he requested that the budget of the Committee include funds to cover the expenses of the accountant.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) pointed out that, according to the Chairman of the Committee, these expenses are already provided for in the proposed budget.

The SECRETARY restated the proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic, to approve the Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization (Document CE19/13), commend the Committee for the work accomplished, and urge it to continue with its task in the same efficient manner. The proposal also called for approval of the proposed expenditures of the Committee for 1953.

DECISION TAKEN

These terms of the proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic were unanimously approved. 2/

Dr. BRADY (United States), a member of the Committee, explained that, through the Director and Staff, the Bureau had made all its facilities available for the study of this question. He pointed out that, in considering the proportion between administrative expenditures and the funds allotted to field programs and to other public health services, it should be kept in mind that the Bureau administers not only the regional programs of the WHO and the PASB programs, but also programs of Technical Assistance, UNICEF, and other specialized agencies in America, a fact which reduces, to a large extent, the proportion of funds for administrative purposes as compared with the total expenditures for all programs.

The session was recessed at 11:10 a.m. and resumed at 11:45 a.m.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) said that during the recess he had learned that not all Members approved of the name of the Committee, which he suggested be renamed "Committee on Co-ordination and Economies".

Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHET (Chile) understood that the term "Decentralization" should be maintained.

The CHAIRMAN pointed out that any change in the name of the Committee would have to be reviewed by the Directing Council, which has the authority to broaden and clarify the purposes of the Committee.

2/Ibid., Resolution V (revised at the Closing Session).
15. **TOPIC 10:** FIRST REPORT OF THE PERMANENT SUBCOMMITTEE ON BUILDINGS AND INSTALLATIONS (Document CE19/11)

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/11 on this topic.

The CHAIRMAN invited Dr. Brady, Chairman of the Permanent Subcommittee on Buildings and Installations, to comment briefly on the Report.

Dr. BRADY (Observer, United States) spoke of the work of the Subcommittee, and stressed its recommendation that construction of a fourth floor on the building at 1501 New Hampshire Avenue not be undertaken at this time, owing to the high cost of the work.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic), a member of the Subcommittee, added to the explanations given by Dr. Brady, pointing out that the initial cost of the building and land was $175,000 and that construction of the fourth floor would represent an additional cost of over $100,000, without sufficiently increasing the value of the property or making available sufficient additional space to justify the expenditure. For this reason, the Subcommittee deems it preferable to improve the existing facilities of the building so as to make maximum use of the space now available.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) supported the proposed resolution appearing in Document CE19/11.

The CHAIRMAN proposed that the resolution mention the Subcommittee's recommendation that construction of the fourth floor on the building at 1501 New Hampshire Avenue not be undertaken at this time.

**DECISION TAKEN**

With the addition proposed by the Chairman, the proposed resolution in Document CE19/11 was unanimously approved.6

The CHAIRMAN said that, owing to the lack of time, it would not be possible to hold meetings of the working parties that day, as planned, and proposed that the Committee take up some of the topics that had been scheduled for the afternoon session.

It was so agreed.

16. **TOPIC 12:** RELATIONS BETWEEN THE PAN AMERICAN SANITARY ORGANIZATION AND NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS (Document CE19/4)

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/4 on this topic.

6/Ibid., Resolution IV (revised at the Closing Session).
Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) asked Dr. Soper to give additional information on the study being made on this subject by the World Health Organization.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) explained that the question of relations with non-governmental organizations had been given further consideration at the 11th Meeting of the WHO Executive Board, and on that occasion the Director-General of the WHO presented a document containing several suggestions for the solution of the problem. After long debate, the Board decided not to approve any of the suggested solutions, deeming that the World Health Assembly is the body that should rule on the matter.

At the request of Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic), Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) gave a detailed account of the discussions on this subject at the 11th Meeting of the WHO Executive Board. He made special mention of the Board's report to the World Health Assembly on relations with non-governmental organizations (EB11/WP/7).

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic), agreeing with the Director, saw no need for making any decision on this matter. He added that the Pan American Union is studying a resolution on this question of relations with non-governmental agencies, which might serve as a guide for the PASB.

Dr. SOZAYA (Mexico) seconded the Director's recommendation contained in the document under discussion.

DECISION TAKEN

The opinion of the Director that discussion of this topic be postponed, as stated in Document CE19/4, was unanimously approved. /7/
17. **TOPIC 8: AMENDMENTS TO THE STAFF RULES OF THE PAN AMERICAN SANITARY BUREAU** (Document CE19/6)

The CHAIRMAN announced that Document CE19/6 would be considered, beginning with the study of Annex A.

The Representative of Panama proposed that the articles of the Staff Rules be approved in the order in which they are considered.

It was so agreed.

The SECRETARY read the new text of Article 750, concerning extra compensation for staff members temporarily assuming the responsibilities of a vacant established position of higher grade than that which they normally occupy.

Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHET (Chile) asked the Director who determines the length of service in the temporary post.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) explained the purpose of the change, which is designed to enable the staff member to receive the salary of the higher grade by the fourth month of such service.

Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHET (Chile) felt that it would be fairer to grant the higher salary by the second month of such service.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) pointed out that the proposed amendment is in conformity with the existing regulation of the WHO.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) believed that, insofar as possible, the Staff Rules of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau should be identical with those of the World Health Organization.

The CHAIRMAN felt that the Bureau should follow closely the policies of the World Health Organization in these matters, even though there might be differences between the regulations of the two organizations. He maintained that the Executive Committee has authority to rule on this matter.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) recalled that part of the staff of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau is on the payroll of the World Health Organization and, from the administrative viewpoint, it is therefore advisable that the Rules of the two organizations be identical or similar.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) pointed out that the Directing Council of the Pan American Sanitary Organization acts also as Regional Committee
of the WHO and for this reason the Staff Rules of the WHO should apply
to the PASB. Any amendments introduced in these Rules would have to be
presented to the World Health Organization.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) explained that the amendments intro-
duced in the Staff Rules by the WHO in previous cases had been adopted by
the United Nations and other international organizations. Such amend-
ments had even been prepared by a co-ordinating committee of the various
international agencies. He invited Mr. Hinderer to offer additional ex-
planations on the subject.

Mr. HINDERER (Chief, Division of Administration, PASB) said that
the proposed amendments would be desirable in themselves, even though
they had not been introduced by the WHO. With regard to the amendment
under discussion, he said it should be adopted for reasons of effective
administration and expediency in cases of temporary appointments to
vacant posts.

Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHET (Chile) reiterated his previous statements
and made the specific proposal that a staff member temporarily assigned
to a post of a higher grade should begin to receive the salary of that
grade by the second month of such service.

The CHAIRMAN submitted the proposal of the Representative of Chile
for consideration. As it was not seconded, he then put to a vote the pro-
posed amendment to Article 750 of the Staff Rules appearing in Document
CE19/6.

DECISION TAKEN

The amendment to Article 750 of the Staff Rules (Document CE19/6)
was unanimously approved.

The session was adjourned at 12:50 p.m.
PRECIS MINUTES OF THE FOURTH PLENARY SESSION
Washington, D. C.
Wednesday, 22 April 1953, at 2:50 p.m.

Chairman: Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN
(later) Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA
Ecuador Brazil
Secretary: Dr. Miguel E. BUSTAMANTE
Pan American Sanitary Bureau

SUMMARY

18. Topic 8: Amendments to the Staff Rules of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/6) (Conclusion)

19. Topic 7: Remuneration of the International Staff Members of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/8)

20. Topic 15: Repayment of Loans to the Rockefeller and Kellogg Foundations (Document CE19/5)

21. Topic 16: Status of Quota Contributions (Document CE19/16)

22. Topic 13: Inter-American Medical Congresses (Document CE19/17)
PRESENT:

Members:

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA
Dr. Oscar JIMENEZ PINOCET
Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN
Dr. Lucien PIERRE-NOEL
Dr. José ZOZAYA
Dr. Alberto BISSOT
Dr. Fred L. SOPER (ex-officio)
Dr. M. G. CANDAU

The following Member was absent: DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

Other Participants:

Governments:

Mr. Gabriel ROSAZ, Observer
Baron C. W. VAN BOETZELAER, Observer
Mr. Howard B. CAIDENWOOD, Observer
Mr. Simon N. WILSON

Inter-Governmental Organizations:

Mr. Paul R. KELBAUGH

Pan American Sanitary Bureau (PASB):

Mr. Harry A. HINDERER, Chief, Division of Administration
The CHAIRMAN requested the Secretary to determine whether there was a quorum.

The SECRETARY reported that the Representatives of Brazil, Chile, Ecuador, Haiti, Mexico, and Panama were present.

The CHAIRMAN announced that there was a quorum.

18. TOPIC 8: AMENDMENTS TO THE STAFF RULES OF THE PAN AMERICAN SANITARY BUREAU (Document CE19/6) (Conclusion)

The CHAIRMAN stated that consideration of Topic 8 would be continued, and asked the Secretary to read Article 953.1 of the Staff Rules.

There being no comments, the question was put to a vote.

DECISION TAKEN

By a vote of five to zero, Chile abstaining, the new text of Article 953.1 of the Staff Rules was approved.

The SECRETARY read Annex B of Document CE19/6 on "Changes in Conditions of Service for Project Staff".

The CHAIRMAN invited Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) to explain the proposed changes. The Director said they referred to the project staff and were designed to make their working conditions uniform with those of the regular staff of the Bureau. He said that previously the project staff were subject to special appointment, salaries, and conditions, and it sometimes happened that they were governed by a set of rules different from those of the regular staff with whom they worked.

The SECRETARY read the changes as to titles, grades, salaries, within-grade increases, children's allowance, education grant, dependents' allowance, project service allowance, installation, field equipment allowance, leave, travel, and Pension or Provident Fund.

The question was then put to a vote.

DECISION TAKEN

All the proposed changes relative to project staff were approved by a vote of five to zero, Chile abstaining.
Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) pointed out that the new articles of the Staff Rules relating to the points under discussion appear on pages 7, 8, 9, and 10 of Annex B of Document CE19/6. He recognized that in some cases the changes just approved will be disadvantageous to the individuals concerned, but these disadvantages are offset by the new benefits they will gain.

The CHAIRMAN remarked that the education grant is not included among the new articles of the Rules appearing on page 7.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) explained that in the case of the education grant there was no need to amend the wording of the existing Rule, adding that this grant will be given in addition to the allowance provided for in Article 850. Its purpose is to better protect the interests of the family.

Mr. HINDERER (Chief, Division of Administration, PASB) stated that the dependents' allowance is being granted for the first time to project personnel.

The CHAIRMAN pointed out that the Committee had approved the right of project personnel to receive the education grant, to which they formerly were not entitled, but that this grant is not mentioned in the text of the articles appearing on page 7 and following pages of Document CE19/6.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) agreed with the point raised by the Chairman and added that other rights just approved for project staff were not mentioned in the text of the articles presented in the document under discussion.

Mr. HINDERER (Chief, Division of Administration, PASB) explained that the project staff formerly received no special remuneration for dependents and that, as in the case of the education grant, the proposed amendment, extends the benefits of the allowance to this personnel.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) recalled that the Technical Assistance Board established the conditions of service for the personnel it appointed, and this personnel formerly received, in addition, lodging from the Government of the country in which they rendered service. Article 845 provides compensation for this personnel.

Mr. CAIDERWOOD (Observer, United States) felt that the confusion which appears to exist might disappear if the actual texts of the existing rules under consideration, as well as of the amendments adopted by the Technical Assistance Board, were presented in a document.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) did not share this view. In his opinion the confusion arose because it had not been borne in mind that only the new articles appear on pages 7, 8, 9, and 10 of the document under discussion.
Dr. CANDAU (Assistant Director, PASB) made further reference to the point raised by the Representative of Mexico that only the new articles appeared in their entirety in Document CE19/6. He called attention to Article 1641 at the bottom of page 7, which confirms what had been said, as it provides that staff members appointed for periods of one year or more shall be subject to all the provisions of the Staff Rules except as stated in that Article.

The SECRETARY read the proposed resolution appearing in Document CE19/6.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) proposed that the operative part of the resolution state that the amendments introduced are designed to make uniform the conditions of service of the entire staff of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau, bringing them into harmony with those of the World Health Organization and other international agencies.

DECISION TAKEN

The proposed resolution in Document CE19/6, with the addition proposed by the Representative of Mexico, was approved by a vote of five to zero, Chile abstaining.

19. TOPIC 7: REMUNERATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL STAFF MEMBERS OF THE PAN AMERICAN SANITARY BUREAU (Document CE19/8)

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/8 on this topic.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) proposed that Article 710 of the Staff Rules state that the salaries of the Assistant Director and the Secretary General are proposed (propuestos) by the Director of the Bureau and approved by the Executive Committee, instead of "are fixed (determinados) by the Director of the Bureau with the approval of the Executive Committee". He wished to know the wording of the English text of the Rule.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) said that in the English text those salaries "are fixed" and that the translation is exact, although he shared the opinion of the Representative of Mexico with respect to the Spanish text.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) stated that he did not wish to discuss the substance of the question, since at present these salaries are fixed, and he also recalled that the changes previously made had originated in the Committee itself. He called attention to the fact that the text read is the one now in force, and that any change in it would have to follow the prescribed procedure. In closing, he declared that the Rule under discussion is the same as that operative in the United Nations and in other international agencies, and that any change in it would mean rectifying a generally held criterion.

8/ Ibid., Resolution VIII.
The CHAIRMAN agreed with the first statements of Dr. Soper, but emphasized a statement he had made in the morning session to the effect that the Pan American Sanitary Bureau was desirous of following as closely as possible the rules applied by the WHO, although that fact in no way interfered with the deliberations and resolutions of the Executive Committee when the Committee deemed it advisable, after studying the matter, for the Bureau to adopt special rules. He called attention to the fact that the document under discussion did not contain a proposed resolution and asked the Director to clarify that point.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) requested that Articles 12.2 of the Staff Regulations and 1600 of the Staff Rules be read.

The SECRETARY read these articles and Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) withdrew his proposal that the text of Article 710 be changed.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that his opinion on the matter was contained in the last paragraph of the document under discussion.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) agreed with the Director's view and proposed that a draft resolution be prepared stating that the salary and allowance plan set forth in the existing Staff Rules provides equitable remuneration for the internationally recruited staff assigned to the Washington Office and Zone Areas, and that the resolution adopted be transmitted to the Directing Council together with Document CE19/8.

DECISION TAKEN

The proposal of the Representative of Brazil was unanimously approved. 2/)

The session was recessed at 4:40 p.m. and was resumed 10 minutes later.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil), the Vice-Chairman, took the Chair, expressing his thanks for the honor paid him and stating that he felt a little hesitant because he considered it very difficult to take the place of the Representative of Ecuador, who had presided so ably and intelligently over the previous sessions.

20. TOPIC 15: REPAYMENT OF LOANS TO THE ROCKEFELLER AND KELLOGG FOUNDATIONS (Document CE19/5)

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) recalled that the Rockefeller Foundation and the Kellogg Foundation came to the aid of the Bureau at a time when it was having financial difficulties due to delays in the payment of quotas, and made it possible to purchase the Headquarters buildings. The

2/ Ibid., Resolution VII.
loans stipulate a period of six years for repayment, and were granted without interest. He considered that the existing surplus should be used to liquidate the obligations outstanding with the two Foundations. He recalled that last year it was expected that the budget would be increased, and therewith the reserves in the Working Capital Fund, but since a smaller budget was approved, it is not necessary to keep so large a reserve as had been anticipated. He stressed the fact that approval of his proposal would add to the Bureau's credit.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) wished to know what effects the decrease in Technical Assistance funds would have on future programs, and he asked if it would not be wise to keep on hand the amount in question.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that it is impossible to foresee what the situation of the Technical Assistance program will be in 1954 and emphasized the desirability of repaying the loans from the Rockefeller and Kellogg Foundations.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) said he would agree with the Director's proposal, provided repayment of these loans is postponed until the end of 1953 in case the funds should be needed for the execution of programs.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) supported the Director's proposal, which he considered of great importance, as it is based on the desire to maintain the Bureau's credit with the Rockefeller and Kellogg Foundations. He considered it advisable to pay off these loans rather than reserve these sums for obligations not yet incurred.

Dr. BISSOT (Panama) was in agreement with Dr. Zozaya, adding that, in his opinion, the funds under discussion could not be used to pay for field programs now charged against Technical Assistance funds.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) recalled that a precedent exists with regard to the utilization of sums in the Working Capital Fund for field programs, since in Havana it was agreed to take this measure in connection with the campaign against malaria. He withdrew his proposal, but wished to have it made clear that the PASB may utilize the Working Capital Fund to initiate or maintain field programs.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) stated that the Directing Council may determine the manner in which the Working Capital Fund is to be utilized, but he wished to stress the fact that the present policy of the Bureau is to concern itself with long-range programs that it prepares and directs rather than to allocate funds to temporary Technical Assistance programs, even though it is studying which Technical Assistance projects can be included in the Bureau's long-range programs.
The CHAIRMAN pointed out that the subject under discussion is a recommendation from the Executive Committee to the Directing Council, which will meet in October, and therefore repayment of the loans would be made at the end of the year. He agreed with the view of the Director and proposed the approval of the document under consideration.

DECISION TAKEN

The proposed resolution contained in Document CE19/5 was unanimously approved. 10/

21. TOPIC 16: STATUS OF QUOTA CONTRIBUTIONS (Document CE19/16)

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/16 on this topic.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that a year and a half ago he was authorized to negotiate with France, the Netherlands, and the United Kingdom and to establish quota contributions for these nations. He reached an agreement with the first two countries, which have already paid their quotas, and, owing to the fact that he received no answer to the communication he sent to the Government of the United Kingdom in March 1952, he visited London in February 1953, on his return from Geneva. There he was told by the authorities concerned that the matter would have to be discussed with the colonies, since, in the last analysis, it is the colonies that will have to assume payment of the quota once it is established.

Dr. BISSOT (Panama) said it was his understanding that a quota payment is applied to the unpaid quota most in arrears.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) stated that the Financial Regulations contain this provision, but that in some cases, when the Congress of a country appropriates funds to be used for the quota contribution of a certain year, the sum is accepted in order to prevent unsurmountable difficulties under parliamentary procedure.

The CHAIRMAN pointed out that the Committee should merely take note of the information contained in the document presented by the Director and express its satisfaction with the fact that the present situation of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau shows that payments of quotas in arrears for the years prior to 1952 are continuing without interruption.

Speaking as Representative of Brazil, Dr. BRAGA said that, in its budget, the Government of his country provides in advance for the payment of its quotas and when it does so it does not know in advance the amount of the quota that will be assigned to it when the PASB budget is approved later, although this does not prevent its making a subsequent readjustment.

10/ Ibid., Resolution XII.
Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) stated that he will prepare a new report on this matter, bringing it up to date, for the next meeting of the Directing Council.

DECISION TAKEN

The Executive Committee took note of the status of quota contributions as of 15 April 1953 and expressed its satisfaction at the continuing collection of quotas in arrears. The Report on the Status of Quota Contributions will be brought up to date for the Meeting of the Directing Council. 11/

22. TOPIC 13: INTER-AMERICAN MEDICAL CONGRESSES (Document CE19/17)

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/17 on this topic.

DECISION TAKEN

The Executive Committee authorized the Director of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau, when there are no matters requiring consultation with the Executive Committee with respect to the adoption of measures related to the holding of inter-American medical congresses, to transmit an annual report rather than to report at every meeting of the Committee, as provided in Resolution XV of the 16th Meeting. 12/

The session was adjourned at 5:45 p.m.
PRECIS MINUTES OF THE FIFTH PLENARY SESSION
Washington, D. C.
Thursday, 23 April 1953, at 3:00 p. m.

Chairman: Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN Ecuador
Vice-Chairman: Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA Brazil
Secretary: Dr. Miguel E. BUSTAMANTE Pan American Sanitary Bureau

SUMMARY

23. Medical Meeting at Richmond, Virginia

24. Topic 17: Amendments to the Financial Regulations of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Document CE19/7)

25. Topic 18: Dates of the 20th and 21st Meetings of the Executive Committee and VII Meeting of the Directing Council (Document CE19/12)

PRESENT:

Members:

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA - Brazil
Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN - Ecuador
Dr. Lucien PIERRE-NOEL - Haiti
Dr. José ZOZAYA - Mexico
Dr. Alberto BISSOT - Panama
Dr. Fred L. SOPER (ex officio) - Pan American
Dr. M. G. CANDAU - Sanitary Bureau

The following Members were absent: CHILE - DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

Other Participants:

Governments:

Dr. Félix HURTADO, Observer-Adviser - Cuba
Mr. Gabriel ROSAZ, Observer - France
Baron C.W. VAN BOETZELAER, Observer - Netherlands
Mr. Simon N. WILSON - United States

Inter-Governmental Organizations:

Mr. Paul R. KELBAUGH - Organization of American States (OAS)
23. MEDICAL MEETING AT RICHMOND, VIRGINIA

The CHAIRMAN granted the floor to the Observer for Cuba.

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) informed those present that the first joint meeting of the World Medical Association and the Pan American Medical Confederation, which he will attend as Vice-Chairman of the latter, will be held at Richmond, Virginia, and suggested that the Executive Committee send a message of greeting and expression of solidarity.

He expressed the hope that one of the Representatives present would support his suggestion.

The CHAIRMAN asked if the Pan American Sanitary Bureau had been invited to this meeting.

The SECRETARY stated that the Bureau had received an invitation from the Secretary of the World Medical Association about three weeks ago. The Director had replied that, since the date of the meeting coincided with that of the Executive Committee meeting, he would be unable to attend, and at the same time extended his best wishes for its success.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) supported the suggestion of the Observer for Cuba and proposed that a message of greeting be prepared, which could be transmitted to the meeting through Dr. Hurtado.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) supported this proposal.

DECISION TAKEN

It was unanimously decided to send a message of greeting and expression of solidarity to the medical meeting at Richmond, Virginia.

24. TOPIC 17: AMENDMENTS TO THE FINANCIAL REGULATIONS OF THE PAN AMERICAN SANITARY BUREAU (Document CE19/7)

The SECRETARY read the proposed amendment to Article 5.2 appearing in Document CE19/7.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that the Delegation of France had requested that this amendment be changed to read "France" instead of "the Departments of France", in view of the fact that quota payments to the PASB are made by France rather than by the Departments.
Mr. ROSAZ (Observer, France) emphasized that the question is simply a financial one. The Departments of France in the Western Hemisphere (Martinique, Guadaloupe and Guiana) are not financially independent, and France is the juridical person that makes payment to the Pan American Sanitary Organization. He suggested that the difficulty in the wording of the proposed amendment could be obviated by the substitution of the phrase "France, on behalf of the Departments of Martinique, Guadaloupe and Guiana..." in place of "the Departments of France".

The CHAIRMAN observed that such a modification should be given careful study by the Committee, as it would involve mention of the direct participation of an extra-continental government in these functions of the Pan American Sanitary Organization.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) believed the question to be a matter of knowing the international financial position of these territories and whether they can pay their quotas directly.

Dr. BISSOT (Panama) recalled that Resolution XL adopted by the Directing Council at its V Meeting refers to the participation of France, the Netherlands, and the United Kingdom in the budget of the Pan American Sanitary Organization on behalf of their territories in the Region of the Americas, and considered it advisable to adopt the same wording in the amendment under discussion.

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) felt that the question under consideration was a delicate one, because the legal status within the Organization of territories whose parent country is outside the Western Hemisphere has not yet been determined. In this connection, he recalled the statement made by the Representative of the Organization of American States at the Meeting of the Directing Council in Havana, adding that Resolution XL does not define the juridical person making the contribution to the budget of the Pan American Sanitary Organization.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) believed that the wording of the amendment to the Financial Regulations should conform with that appearing in the title of Resolution XL of the Directing Council.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) pointed out that the only question being considered was the wording of the Financial Regulations and this could in no way imply a revision of the Constitution. He added that it is France that makes quota payments directly.

The CHAIRMAN felt that in these matters the spirit and letter of the Constitution should be followed. He proposed that the amendment be stated in the same terms as the wording in the title of Resolution XL adopted at the V Meeting of the Directing Council, so that Regulation 5.2, sub-paragraph b would read as follows:
1. Contributions resulting from the assessment of new Member States under the provisions of Regulation 5.8.

2. Contributions made by France, the Netherlands, and the United Kingdom on behalf of their territories in the Region of the Americas, under the provisions of Resolution XL of the V Meeting of the Directing Council.

DECISION TAKEN

The amendment to Article 5.2, worded as proposed by the Chairman, was unanimously approved.

The SECRETARY read the proposed amendment to Article 7.1 of the Financial Regulations appearing in Document CE19/7.

The CHAIRMAN proposed that the text of this amendment be worded in the same manner as the preceding article.

DECISION TAKEN

The amendment to Article 7.1 of the Financial Regulations was unanimously approved with the wording proposed by the Chairman.

The SECRETARY read the proposed resolution appearing in Document CE19/7, modified to incorporate the two amendments just approved.

DECISION TAKEN

The amended resolution was unanimously approved.


(Document CE19/12)

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/12 on this topic.

Dr. ZDZAYA (Mexico) supported the recommendation of the Director with respect to the dates of these meetings.

Dr. BISSOT (Panama) seconded the recommendation.

DECISION TAKEN

The schedule of dates for the 20th and 21st Meetings of the Executive Committee and VII Meeting of the Directing Council, proposed in Document CE19/12, was unanimously approved.
26. **TOPIC 19: METHOD OF WORK OF THE DIRECTING COUNCIL** (Document CE19/14)

The SECRETARY read Document CE19/14 on this topic.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) observed that the reasons given by the Director in the aforesaid document are in accordance with the experience of previous meetings.

Dr. BISSOT (Panama) felt that the proposal of the Director would result in savings in both time and money.

The CHAIRMAN also considered the Director's proposal to be a good one. As for the reduction in secretariat staff referred to in Document CE19/14, in his opinion the Director and the Secretary should in any event be the ones to decide whether the reduction could be made without affecting the efficiency of the work.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that the main difference would be that committee minutes would not be prepared, but any working parties that it may be considered necessary to establish will be provided with interpreting services.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) was of the opinion that the Committee could suggest but not decide on the elimination of the committees at the meeting of the Directing Council.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that there was always the possibility of the Council's modifying any decision adopted on this matter by the Executive Committee, but his proposal was intended to secure an expression of agreement by the Committee, so that the administrative work for the Directing Council meeting would be facilitated, regardless of what the Council might decide later.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) pointed out that the Executive Committee has competence and authority to adopt decisions without affecting the right of the Directing Council to accept or modify them. He observed that the elimination of the committees is advantageous in view of the fact that the majority of the delegations attending the Directing Council meetings are composed of only one member.

The CHAIRMAN supported the recommendation of the Director appearing in Document CE19/14.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) seconded the recommendation.
DECISION TAKEN

It was unanimously decided to express agreement with the organization of the secretariat services for the next meeting of the Directing Council in the manner proposed in Document CEL9/14. 15/

The session was adjourned at 4:25 p.m.

15/ Ibid., Resolution XVI.
PRECIS MINUTES OF THE SIXTH PLENARY SESSION
Washington, D. C.
Friday, 24 April 1953, at 10:25 a.m.

Chairman: Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN Ecuador
Vice-Chairman: Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA Brazil
Secretary: Dr. Miguel E. BUSTAMANTE Pan American Sanitary Bureau

SUMMARY

27. **Topic 4:** Proposed Program and Budget of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau for 1954 (Document CE19/2)

   Report of Working Party I (Program and Budget) (Document CE19/23)
PRESENT:

Members:

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA, Brazil
Dr. Oscar JIMENEZ PINOCHET, Chile
Dr. Luis F. THOMEN, Dominican Republic
Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN, Ecuador
Dr. Lucien PIERRE-NOEL, Haiti
Dr. José ZOZAYA, Mexico
Dr. Alberto BISSOT, Panama
Dr. Fred L. SOPER (ex officio), Pan American
Dr. M. G. CANDAU, Sanitary Bureau

Other Participants:

Governments:

Baron C. W. VAN BOETZELAER, Observer, Netherlands
Mr. Howard B. CALDERWOOD, Observer, United States
Mr. Simon N. WILSON

Inter-Governmental Organizations:

Mr. Paul R. KELBAUGH, Organization of American States (OAS)

Pan American Sanitary Bureau (PASB):

Mr. Harry A. HENDERER, Chief, Division of Administration
The CHAIRMAN announced that, in conformity with the Order of the Day, the Report presented by Working Party I (Program and Budget) (Document CE19/23) would be discussed.

The SECRETARY read the Report.

Dr. HRAGA (Brasil) requested clarification of the distribution by Zones of the 21 inter-country programs listed in Annex D of the aforesaid document.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) stated that a table with that specific information was available, and it might be included as a new annex to the document.

Mr. HINDERER (Chief, Division of Administration, PASB), in reply to a question from Dr. Zozaya, explained that the amount allotted to smallpox control is $58,000.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that in certain instances the inter-country programs are quite important. In this regard he cited the INCAP and the Pan American Foot-and-Mouth Disease Center established in Brazil, and pointed out the functions that the Zone Offices of the PASB assume with respect to them. He explained that in establishing an exact ratio between the number of programs in each Zone and Bureau expenditures, consideration must be given to the fact that the Bureau has to maintain contact with the governments, organize the meetings of the Executive Committee and the Directing Council, and carry out all administrative functions pertaining to the programs.

In this respect, the Director called attention to paragraph 4 of the Report of the Working Party (Document CE19/23), where it is stated that the total money to be spent in 1954 out of funds from different sources amounts to $6,404,869. Moreover, the UNICEF programs should be included, for the Bureau is responsible for their technical guidance, and this fact causes administrative expenses, although the funds appropriated by the UNICEF for such programs do not pass through the PASB.

The CHAIRMAN referred to the fact that the budget is $90,000 more than that of 1953, and asked the Director to explain the procedure followed in determining the assessments.
Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) replied that after the Directing Council has approved the proposed budget, each Member State is assigned its quota in accordance with the scale of assessments of the Organization of American States.

The CHAIRMAN recalled that at the 1951 meeting of the Directing Council an attempt was made to increase the quotas, and it was agreed to consult the governments. It was his understanding that several of them expressed opposition to an increase.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) explained that the number of governments willing to accept the proposed increase was the same as or slightly greater than the number of governments opposed to the increase. He recalled that at the April 1951 meeting of the Executive Committee the proposed budget submitted for 1953 had an increase of $500,000 over the previous budget. Because not enough replies had been received to make it possible to approve the increase, no concrete decision on the matter could be reached, and lower budget estimates were approved. Any decision reached by the governments as to the total of the budget must be made in the light of their obligations with respect to international organizations. He pointed out that the budget contains an item of $100,000 under miscellaneous income, most of which is the 3 per cent administrative charge on purchases made by the Supply Office for governments and institutions, while the costs of operating that office are charged to the chapter dealing with the Division of Administration.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) then gave a fuller explanation of why the annexes to the document were presented as they were, which was in order to facilitate the classification of the expenses connected with the various services. He offered as an example the fact that under the item Education and Training Services, the total amount of the fellowships appearing in the various chapters had been included in order to give a more exact idea of what the Bureau is spending for these educational activities. He commented on the recommendations that the Working Party made in its report, and expressed the belief that the funds in the budget are well distributed considering the present organization of the Bureau, and that it is incumbent upon the Committee on Economies and Decentralization to study such organizational changes as might be introduced in the future and to submit recommendations thereon.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) stated that the Executive Committee is empowered to introduce changes in the budget without prejudice to the studies being made by the Committee on Economies and Decentralization.

The CHAIRMAN agreed that the Executive Committee is fully authorized to make any changes in the budget it deems appropriate. The Directing Council receives a budget prepared by the Bureau and approved by the Executive Committee.
Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) requested the members of the Working Party to furnish information on organizational changes that they thought might well be introduced into the Bureau.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) pointed out that all budgets are subject to improvement. He added that in recent years the Bureau had made considerable progress in the presentation of its budget, but that the introduction of organizational changes required a detailed study of the entire Organization, such as the study now being carried out by the Committee on Economies and Decentralization, and in this respect he mentioned some of the suggestions on changes in the organizational structure of the Bureau that are contained in the Interim Report submitted by that Committee.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) repeated his earlier remarks and proposed, in the first place, that the Working Party add to its Report the clarifying statement that in view of the brief time available it was not possible to make concrete recommendations on the changes that should be made in the organization of the Bureau, and, in the second place, he requested that the Committee on Economies and Decentralization review the budget for 195_ and present a report thereon at the next meeting of the Executive Committee.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) thought there was no reason why the clarifying statement as to the time factor requested by the Representative of Haiti should not be included in the report, but he stressed the point that recommendations on organizational changes, if any seemed advisable, are the task of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization, which is charged with studying how the funds of the Bureau might be utilized to greater advantage. He felt the Budget was well presented and suggested it be approved and transmitted to the Directing Council.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) pointed out the importance that the Directing Council has always given to the study of the budget. The fact is that the most important economies effected in the previous budgets of the Bureau have been the outcome of proposals made in the Directing Council. The speaker believed that the budget should be transmitted to the Directing Council exactly as submitted.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) recalled that Article 12 (c) of the Constitution states that one function of the Executive Committee is to prepare with the cooperation of the Director of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau a proposed budget for consideration by the Directing Council. He added that it has been the custom to approve the proposed budget for the ensuing year at the April meeting of the Executive Committee, and then to send it to the governments as the budget to be considered by the Directing Council. This does not prevent the Executive Committee from formulating recommendations at its October meeting just prior to the Council meeting. He reminded the Executive Committee that at its next meeting it will have to consider the regional budget of the WHO for 1955, which will then be presented to the Directing Council.
Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) went back to his original statement, because he believed that a study of the budget by the Committee on Economics and Decentralization would give the Executive Committee more detailed information on it.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) said that he did not object to including in the Report of the Working Party the clarification requested by the Representative of Haiti, to the effect that in view of the brief time available the Working Party was unable to make concrete recommendations on possible organizational changes. As Chairman of the Committee on Economics and Decentralization, however, he believed that that Committee would not have sufficient time before the next meeting of the Executive Committee to make the study on the budget suggested in the second part of Dr. Pierre-Noel's proposal.

The CHAIRMAN stated that since the Chairman of Working Party had accepted in the name of the group the sentence regarding the brief time available, it will be included in its report. As regards the second part of the proposal of the Representative of Haiti, referring to the suggestion that the Committee on Economics and Decentralization submit its report on possible organizational changes and revision of the budget to the next meeting of the Executive Committee, the Chairman inquired if Dr. Pierre-Noel still insisted on that point in the light of Dr. Zozaya's remarks on the impossibility of carrying out the work program within a fixed period.

Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHE (Chile), member of the Committee on Economics and Decentralization, suggested that a way might be found to speed up the work of the said Committee so that the proposal of the Representative of Haiti might be carried out as far as possible.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) felt that the program of immediate activities submitted by the Committee on Economics and Decentralization in its Interim Report is closely related to the study of the budget he had proposed. He did not believe, therefore, that the time factor would prove troublesome, and so maintained his stand.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) reminded those present that the study being made by the Committee on Economics would not be finished in 1953 and probably not even in 1954. He pointed out that it was a long, slow task requiring a thorough study of the entire organizational structure of the Bureau in order to achieve a greater number of services with the same amount of money. He still maintained that the Committee did not have sufficient time to make the review of the budget that the Representative of Haiti had requested within the time limit proposed.
Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) reiterated his former remarks.

The CHAIRMAN explained that the Committee on Economies and Decentralization is continuing its studies so that later it may formulate concrete conclusions, but that no time limit has been fixed for this task. As a solution to the problem raised, he suggested that the Committee on Economies and Decentralization be asked to submit, if possible, suggestions on the budget for 1954 at the next meeting of the Executive Committee, so that the latter could transmit such suggestions to the Directing Council in the form of a resolution.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) accepted the Chairman's suggestion.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) declared that the opinions expressed by the Representatives of Haiti and of Mexico seemed equally commendable to him. He foresaw only one difficulty, the lack of time available to the Committee on Economies and Decentralization, as already mentioned by its Chairman, which would not permit a study of the budget within the time limit suggested. Dr. Thomen further stated that, although he agreed with the proposal of the Representative of Haiti, he could not support it in view of Dr. Zozaya's remarks, and deemed it inadvisable to insist further on this point.

The CHAIRMAN remarked that the controversy had arisen simply because two different means of attaining the same goal had been put forward. His suggestion that the Committee on Economies and Decentralization find a means of reporting in the manner proposed by the Representative of Haiti was, he added, neither pressing nor imperative; it had merely been offered in an attempt to find a harmonious solution to the problem raised.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) said that the proposal of the Representative of Haiti would break with tradition, since the Executive Committee has never yet fixed a time limit for any Committee to present its report. He added that the Committee on Economies and Decentralization was doing its very best but could not accept a time limit for the presentation of its report, nor did it have time to complete it by the date proposed.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) stated his former position once more and added that if the Committee on Economies and Decentralization could not complete, within the time limit proposed, the study of the budget he had suggested, it would even be advisable to prolong the present meeting of the Executive Committee, so that it might make such a study.

Dr. ERAGA (Brazil) remarked that the discussion was being prolonged to no purpose, owing to a misinterpretation. He stated that the Working Party of which he was a member had studied the budget carefully and found it basically correct. In the future, once the Committee on Economies and Decentralization had finished its study of the organization of the Bureau and made its recommendations on the matter, it would be possible to introduce improvements. The present issue, however, dealt with two completely separate and distinct matters.
Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHET (Chile) declared that in view of the turn the
discussion had taken and in the light of Dr. Zozaya's specific statements
on a fixed period, he felt obligated to withdraw his support of the pro-
posal made by the Representative of Haiti.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) thereupon said that it was not the intent
of his proposal to exert pressure on the Committee on Economies and
Decentralization. His sole desire had been to see the task of the
Committee accomplished in the most effective manner possible. However,
in view of all the opinions expressed, he withdrew his proposal.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) felt that the confusion had arisen because
the report of the Working Party had included a reference to the Committee
on Economies and Decentralization, and because the sentence proposed by
Dr. Pierre-Noel on the matter of lack of time had been accepted. The
truth is, however, that the budget submitted was quite satisfactory within
the framework of the present organization of the Bureau and required no
revision for presentation to the Directing Council.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) wished to rectify any false
impression that might have been gained from the discussion and to make
his position clear. The Pan American Sanitary Bureau had, since 1947,
undergone great changes, so that today it is the best organization
in the field of public health. Even greater organizational improvements
could be made, he said, on the basis of the study made by the Committee
on Economies and Decentralization, and that was why reference was made to
that Committee in the Report of the Working Party. But the budget for
1954 is good, well presented, and well conceived; it had been gone over
with a critical eye and was an improvement over the previous one, which
in turn had been better than the one before. There has been, therefore,
a constant improvement in this respect, and when the study has been
completed and the suggested organizational changes have been made, we
shall be able to say that we have a perfect budget.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) then stated that in the Report of the Working
Party mention was made of Article 12 (C) of the Constitution and Resolution
I of the 16th Meeting of the Executive Committee, which authorize the Ex-
cecutive Committee to present the proposed budget to the Directing Council.

The CHAIRMAN then announced that the discussion would be continued
at the afternoon session.

The session was adjourned at 1:10 p.m.
PRECIS MINUTES OF THE SEVENTH PLENARY SESSION
Washington, D. C.
Friday, 24 April 1953, at 3:20 p.m.

Chairman: Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN Ecuador
(later) Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA Brazil

Secretary: Dr. Miguel E. BUSTAMANTE Pan American Sanitary Bureau

SUMMARY

28. Topic 4: Proposed Program and Budget of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau for 1954 (Document CE19/2)(Conclusion)

Report of Working Party I (Program and Budget) (Document CE19/23) (Conclusion)


30. Attendance of the American States at the Sixth World Health Assembly

31. Votes of Thanks and Message to Dr. César Vélez Morán
PRESENT:

Members:

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA
Dr. Oscar JIMENEZ PINOCHET
Dr. Luis F. THOMEN
Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN
Dr. Lucien PIERRE-NOEL
Dr. José ZOZAYA
Dr. Alberto BISSOT
Dr. Fred L. SOPER (ex officio)
Dr. M. G. CANDAU

Other Participants:

Governments:

Mr. Gabriel ROSAZ, Observer
Baron C. W. VAN BORSTELLAER, Observer
Mr. Howard B. CALDERWOOD, Observer
Mr. Simon N. WILSON

Inter-Governmental Organizations:

Mr. Paul R. KELBAUGH

Pan American Sanitary Bureau (PASB):

Mr. Harry A. HINDERER, Chief, Division of Administration
The CHAIRMAN announced that discussion of the Report of Working Party I would continue.

28. TOPIC 4: PROPOSED PROGRAM AND BUDGET OF THE PAN AMERICAN SANITARY BUREAU FOR 1954 (Document CE19/2) (Conclusion)

Report of Working Party I (Program and Budget) (Document CE19/23) (Conclusion)

At the request of the Chairman, the SECRETARY read the revised text of the last paragraph of the Report of Working Party I, which was amended to incorporate the changes suggested during the discussion, as follows:

"In the opinion of the Working Party, the Program and Budget of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau for 1954 is a well-distributed one, considering the present organization of the Bureau. The Working Party recommends that the Executive Committee accept Document CE19/2, and transmit it to the Directing Council pursuant to Article 12-C of the Constitution of the Pan American Sanitary Organization and Resolution I of the 16th Meeting of the Executive Committee. It is further recommended that the Director, in the future, prepare analytical tables similar to those presented in the Annexes to this report."

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico), as Chairman of the Working Party, agreed to the text that had just been read.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil), as Rapporteur of the Working Party, also agreed to the new text of the last paragraph of the Report.

The CHAIRMAN invited the Vice-Chairman to take the Chair, as he wished to make certain comments on the document under discussion.

Dr. Braga (Brazil) took the Chair.

Dr. MONTALVAN (Ecuador) commented further on a question he had raised at the morning session with regard to the quota contributions of the countries. He recalled that the Governments of the various countries had been consulted on the increase in quotas, and although some of them had agreed to the increase, others had not agreed. In his opinion, the last sentence of the first paragraph on page 2 of the Report of the Working Party should be modified, for the reference to the amount "which should be requested of the Governments" went beyond the function of the Executive Committee, which was solely to carry out the decisions of the Directing Council, and the latter, as far as he knew, had taken no decision with regard to an increase in the quotas of the countries.
Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) explained that there is no fixed quota for each country and that the percentage they pay varies according to the decisions adopted by the Council of the Organization of American States. The scale of assessments is calculated on the basis of census figures and the ability to pay of each country. It is not a question of increasing the percentage used for calculating the quotas of the countries, which are notified each year as to the amount of their respective contribution. The procedure is always the same, but the amount of the quota is not a fixed one, as it is related to the total amount of the budget.

Dr. MONTALVAN (Ecuador) wished to know when the resolution had been adopted stipulating that the quotas would be calculated on the basis of a percentage of the amount of the approved Budget and would no longer have a fixed limit.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) referred to the terms of Article 60 of the Pan American Sanitary Code, which provides that the funds of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau shall be assessed on the Governments on the same basis or proportion as are the expenses of the Pan American Union. Until 1948, the Union calculated the quotas on a per-thousand inhabitants basis. This system was changed after the establishment of the United Nations, which adopted as a criterion the ability to pay of each country. Under the latter system, the contribution assigned to the United States represented 85% of the total budget of the United Nations. However, the contribution of the United States to the Organization of American States and to the Pan American Sanitary Bureau, which calculated their quotas on a per capita basis, represented only 52% of the budgets of these organizations. As a result of representations made by the Latin American countries, a new system for the calculation of quotas was established, based 60% on ability to pay and 40% on population. Under this system, the 85% quota of the United States was reduced to 72%. Contributions were received on this basis by the Organization of American States in 1948 and by the Pan American Sanitary Bureau six months later. Subsequently, the United States expressed its opposition to having any country contribute more than two thirds of the budget of any international organization, and over a period of four or five years the quota assigned to that country gradually decreased until it reached the maximum limit of 66%. Finally, the Director recalled that Article 8-D of the Constitution of the Pan American Sanitary Organization stipulates: "The Council shall review and approve the annual budget of the Organization".

Dr. MONTALVAN (Ecuador) said that he was satisfied, in part, with the information just given by the Director, but he maintained that the Directing Council has consulted the Member Countries on the increase in quotas, and recalled that this had been done in 1951. In his opinion, to consult the Governments would indicate that one did not have the right to fix the quotas without their agreement. In conclusion, he said, that, although he still had doubts, he would not request the Executive Committee to rule on the matter, but wished to have his reservations placed on record.
Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) pointed out that the consultation to which Dr. Montalvan (Ecuador) had referred, which took place in 1951, was explained by the fact that the preliminary Budget for 1953 had been presented in advance, which the Director had done with a view to achieving coordination with the Budget of the World Health Organization. The preliminary Budget gave the total amount of the future budget but not the details thereof. At its V Meeting in 1951 the Directing Council approved Resolution IV authorizing the Director to consult with the Governments concerning the preliminary Budget for 1953, which he did; fifteen replies were received, as shown in Document CE16/4. Of this number, six were favorable to the total amount of $2,500,000, one favored the amount of $2,000,000, and another agreed to an increase but not such a large one; four were of the opinion that the budget should be the same as in 1952. This information was presented to guide the Directing Council and the Executive Committee. The latter recommended to the Council that the total budget for 1953 be the same as that for the preceding year, and the Directing Council accepted this recommendation in September. It should always be borne in mind that the Governments express their views through the vote of their representatives on the Directing Council and that this body has full power to rule on the question.

Dr. MONTALVAN (Ecuador) thanked the Director for his explanation, saying that he was completely satisfied in view of the final statements made by Dr. Soper.

Mr. CALDERWOOD (Observer, United States) said that his Government is now engaged in carrying out a policy of economies, a fact that he wished to make known at this time so that silence on his part would not be taken to mean tacit approval, in advance, of any increase in quotas.

Dr. JIMENEZ PINOCHET (Chile) stated that it is the general policy of the Government of Chile not to accept increases in quota contributions to international organizations. However, as the increase in question is so small, it is to be hoped that it will be accepted, particularly in view of the good relations maintained by his country with the Bureau and its very high opinion of the work the Bureau is doing.

The CHAIRMAN, speaking as Representative of Brazil, said that his country continues to feel some concern over the increase in quotas, despite its interest in the work being carried out by the Bureau. He believed that the statements of the Representative of Chile express the views of all the representatives, but, in final analysis, the Directing Council is the body to make a final decision.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) asked whether a resolution had been drafted for the transmittal of this document to the Directing Council.
The SECRETARY stated that the wording of the resolution might be based on approval of the report of the Working Party and the procedure set forth in Resolution I of the 16th Meeting of the Executive Committee.

DECISION TAKEN

The Proposed Program and Budget for 1954 submitted by the Director of the Bureau (Document CE19/2) and the revised Report of Working Party I (Program and Budget), were unanimously approved. The Secretary was asked to submit to the Drafting Committee the draft text of the resolution for the Final Report. 16/

Dr. Montalvan (Ecuador) then resumed the Chair.

29. **TOPIC 5: FINANCIAL REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR AND REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL AUDITOR FOR 1952** (Document CE19/10) (Conclusion)


The SECRETARY read the Report submitted by Working Party II.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) commended Working Party II on having carried out its study so rapidly, and expressed his pleasure at the methodical manner in which consideration was given to each point contained in the reports of the Director and the External Auditor. He did not believe it appropriate to speak of a "misunderstanding", as mentioned on page 3 of the Report, since it is later pointed out that there had been a failure to take timely measures, owing to certain circumstances. He therefore felt that the Auditor might well have used the word "error". He also said that he would like to have seen a comment in the Report regarding point 9 of the Report of the External Auditor, which states "There is no valid excuse...", although he himself did not know whether or not there was a valid excuse. He stressed the importance of the second to last paragraph on page 3, which refers to the Director's assurances to the Working Party that this situation will not recur. He agreed with the view of the Working Party that there has been no "unsound financial management" with regard to investments, if it is a question of investments in bonds redeemable upon demand, such as United States Government bonds. He also felt that it is not the proper time to stabilize the Working Capital Fund at a fixed level, although he considered it desirable to do so in the future. In conclusion, he congratulated the Working Party, especially on the final paragraph of its Report, and proposed that the reports of the Director, the External Auditor, and the Working Party be approved.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) pointed out that investments are made in Government bonds and that, with regard to the much-criticized "overdraft", neither the Bank nor the Bureau was affected. He called attention to the fact that in the second paragraph of point (c) on page 4 of the English text of the Working Party's report, reference is erroneously made to the "Pan American Union" instead of the "Pan American Sanitary Bureau". He also pointed out that page 4, point (a), second paragraph, the English text says "mass resignations" while the Spanish text says only "renuncias".

Dr. THOMÉN (Dominican Republic) observed that the Spanish text is the original and that the differences pointed out by the Director can easily be corrected by the Secretariat.

Dr. ZOZAIA (Mexico) agreed with the statements of the Representative of the Dominican Republic and called special attention to the objectives mentioned on page 5 of the Report, which he felt constitute a goal for the future. In closing, he added his congratulations to those already extended to the Working Party.

Mr. CALDERWOOD (Observer, United States) commented on the ideas set forth on page 5 of the Report, stating that before any transfer of funds could be made between the different organizations their prior approval was necessary, and he expressed doubt with regard to the advisability of establishing a common fund.

Dr. JIMÉNEZ PINOCHET (Chile), on behalf of the Working Party, thanked the Executive Committee for its expression of congratulations. He wished to make it clear that the Working Party is not in agreement with the term "overdraft" as it is used in the Report of the External Auditor and that, although such an overdraft might have occurred, circumstances prevented this from happening. He referred to the suggestion of the Auditor on the need to stabilize the Working Capital Fund at a fixed level, which, according to the Auditor, should be 60% of the total budget in order to enable the Bureau to provide for any contingency. In the opinion of the speaker, it would be better not to stabilize the Fund at a fixed level, so that it could be adjusted to the budget of the following year. With regard to the opinion stated in the Report regarding the establishment of a single integrated budget based on contributions from the international organizations engaged in programs in America, Dr. Jiménez felt that such a plan represents an ideal toward which we may strive.

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) observed that in the Report of the Working Party certain criticisms are made of the Report of the External Auditor and that the Committee's approval of the Report of the Working Party would imply approval of these criticisms, which was not the intention of the Working Party.
The CHAIRMAN said that approval of the Report of Working Party II would be approval of its conclusions and recommendations concerning the reports of the External Auditor and the Director.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) wished to know the opinion of the Director of the Bureau with respect to the Working Party's authority to change the policy in regard to the Working Capital Fund.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) saw nothing to prevent the Executive Committee from expressing its opinion on the Working Capital Fund and the recommendations of the External Auditor. He explained that the factors justifying the level of the Working Capital Fund are variable and that in recent years, owing to the payment of quotas in arrears, the level of the Fund has been raised. In future years, should the countries bring their accounts up to date so that there would be no more payments of quotas in arrears, there would be no need to maintain such a large reserve. For the moment, he felt that 60% is a reasonable sum. He agreed with the suggestion that the Working Capital Fund be stabilized at a fixed level, but considered it advisable to wait until more experience has been gained.

There being no further discussion, the CHAIRMAN put to a vote the Report of Working Party II (Document CE19/25) and the conclusions and recommendations contained therein.

DECISION TAKEN

The Report of Working Party II concerning the Financial Report of the Director and the Report of the External Auditor was unanimously approved. The Secretary was requested to submit to the Drafting Committee the draft text of the resolution for the Final Report. 17/30

ATTENDANCE OF THE AMERICAN STATES AT THE SIXTH WORLD HEALTH ASSEMBLY

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) stated that the Sixth World Health Assembly will meet in Geneva within a short time and, in view of the importance of this meeting, he proposed that it be recommended to the American Governments that they send official delegations so that they might take an active part in the said Assembly.

The CHAIRMAN considered this proposal to be in order and suggested that, to make the recommendation more effective, it would be advisable to send it by cable.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) seconded Dr. Thomen's proposal.

17/ Ibid., Resolution II.
DECISION TAKEN

The proposal of the Representative of the Dominican Republic was unanimously approved. 18/

31. VOTES OF THANKS AND MESSAGE TO DR. CESAR VELEZ MORAN

The CHAIRMAN then consulted with the Representatives on the preparation of the customary votes of thanks that are adopted at the close of each Executive Committee meeting. He proposed that the Drafting Committee be charged with preparing the votes of thanks to be approved at the final session held by the Executive Committee.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) asked the Executive Committee to transmit to Dr. César Vélez Morán, the titular Representative of Ecuador on the Executive Committee, its wishes for a speedy recovery from his present illness.

Dr. BRAZA (Brazil) seconded the proposal of the Representative of Haiti.

The CHAIRMAN, on behalf of his delegation, expressed deep appreciation for this evidence of regard and solidarity. He accepted it with great pleasure as proof of the lofty sentiments of the countries cooperating in public health activities, and said he was sure the message would speed Dr. Vélez Morán's recovery.

DECISION TAKEN

The proposals of the Chairman and the Representative of Haiti were unanimously approved. 19/

The meeting was adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

18/ Ibid., Resolution XVII.
19/ Ibid., Resolution XIX.
PRECIS MINUTES OF THE EIGHTH PLENARY SESSION
Washington, D. C.
Monday, 27 April 1953, at 4:30 p.m.

Chairman: Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN
Vice-Chairman: Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA
Secretary: Dr. Miguel E. BUSTAMANTE

SUMMARY

32. Reading and Approval of the Final Report (Document CE19/28)

33. Closing Speech by the Chairman of the 19th Meeting of the Executive Committee
PRESENT:

Members:

Dr. Ernani de Paiva Ferreira BRAGA  
Dr. Oscar JIMENEZ PINOCHET  
Dr. Luis F. THOMEN  
Dr. Juan A. MONTALVAN  
Dr. Lucien PIERRE-NOEL  
Dr. José ZOZAYA  
Dr. Alberto BISSOT  
Dr. Fred L. SOPER (ex officio)  
Dr. M. G. CANDAU

Brazil  
Chile  
Dominican Republic  
Ecuador  
Haiti  
Mexico  
Panama  
Pan American  
Sanitary Bureau

Other Participants:

Governments:

Dr. Félix HURTADO, Observer-Adviser  
Mr. Gabriel ROSAZ, Observer  
Baron C. W. VAN BOETZELAER, Observer  
Mr. Howard B. CALDERWOOD, Observer  
Mr. Simon N. WILSON

Cuba  
France  
Netherlands  
United States

Inter-Governmental Organizations:

Mr. Paul R. KELBAUGH

Organization of  
American States (OAS)
32. READING AND APPROVAL OF THE FINAL REPORT (Document CE19/28)

The CHAIRMAN announced that the work of the 19th Meeting of the Executive Committee had come to a close, and that the present session would be devoted to the reading, approval, and signing of the Final Report.

The SECRETARY read the introductory pages of the Final Report.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) pointed out the advisability of reading all the resolutions contained in the Final Report, so that the Representatives could review the final texts thereof.

The SECRETARY then read Resolutions I, II, and III.

With regard to Resolution III (Third Report of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution), Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) pointed out that, as a question of substance and not merely of wording, the term "approve the Third Report of the Permanent Committee" should be replaced by the expression "take note of", which is the appropriate action to take in this case. He said that a similar comment could be made concerning the Resolution V - Committee on Economies and Decentralization.

Mr. CALDERWOOD (Observer, United States) said that he had thought of making a similar suggestion and he therefore supported Dr. Zozaya's statement.

The CHAIRMAN stated that, in his opinion, there were two distinct situations: in some cases the reports merely give an account of the activities of a committee, as in the case of the Report of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution of the Pan American Sanitary Organization; in other cases, the committees' reports contain suggestions, recommendations, and conclusions, as does the Report of the Permanent Subcommittee on Buildings and Installations. With regard to the former, it is appropriate merely to take note of the report, whereas in the second case the report can be approved. He felt that in the case of Resolution III the following wording would be acceptable: "The Executive Committee, having taken note of the Report... Resolves to approve the work of the Committee..."

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) believed the difficulty arose from the fact that one resolution states "take note of" and the other "approve". He felt that the solution suggested by the Chairman was the correct one, and that it was not worth while to revise the wording of Resolution III.
Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) insisted on the point he had raised, as some committees must report to the Executive Committee and others to the Directing Council. He maintained that if the word "approve" were used, the Executive Committee would be assuming authority that it did not have. He proposed the following wording: "The Executive Committee, having taken note of the Third Report of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution (Document CE19/15), Resolves: To thank the members of the Permanent Committee for the work they have done so far."

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) supported the proposal.

DECISION TAKEN

Resolution III was unanimously approved in the form proposed by the Representative of Mexico.

The SECRETARY then read Resolution IV (Permanent Subcommittee on Buildings and Installations).

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) believed that, in this case, the Executive Committee should "approve" and not merely "take note of" the report, so as to place its opinion on record.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) recalled that the Permanent Subcommittee on Buildings and Installations is a committee of the Directing Council and not of the Executive Committee, and for this reason the term "take note of" was used rather than "approve".

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) recognized that, in this case, it was not within the competence of the Executive Committee to give its approval, but he maintained that it could state its agreement with the report of the Subcommittee.

The CHAIRMAN suggested that in paragraph 2 of the operative part, the phrase "and support the recommendation of the Subcommittee" be used instead of "calling attention to the recommendation of the Subcommittee".

The Representatives of Chile and the Dominican Republic supported the change proposed by the Chairman.

DECISION TAKEN

Resolution IV was unanimously approved with the change proposed by the Chairman.

The SECRETARY read Resolution V (Committee on Economies and Decentralization of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau).
Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) said that this was another case in which it did not appear appropriate to use the expression "approve the Report of the Committee".

The CHAIRMAN recalled that Resolution XVII of the VI Meeting of the Directing Council stipulates that the Committee on Economies and Decentralization is to report periodically to the Executive Committee, and authorizes the latter to apply any economies effected to additional projects in the field. In the light of this resolution of the Directing Council, he believed that the Executive Committee could approve the Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization.

Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) pointed out that the Directing Council resolution authorizes the Director to defray the expenses of the committee in question. For this reason, he saw no need for the second paragraph of Resolution V.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) felt that it was merely a matter of courtesy to inform the Executive Committee of the progress of work, as the Committee on Economies and Decentralization had done in its report, and it therefore appeared inappropriate to "approve" the committee's report.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) supported the suggestion of the Observer for Cuba, proposing that the second paragraph of the operative part of the resolution be deleted and that the Executive Committee limit itself to congratulating the Committee on its work.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) disagreed with this proposal, as he felt that, although the Director is authorized to defray the expenses of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization, the Executive Committee should approve those expenses.

The CHAIRMAN pointed out that, if the proposal of the Representative of Haiti were adopted, a motion to reconsider the topic under discussion would be necessary, as the Committee, at a previous session, had approved the paragraph which it is now proposed to delete and the wording of which is now under discussion.

Dr. SCOPER (Director, PASB) explained that he is authorized to make transfers of credits between Parts I, II, and III of the Budget, provided that such transfers do not exceed 10% of the total of the Part; transfers in excess of 10% cannot be made without the prior concurrence of the Executive Committee. Therefore, within Part I expenses can be defrayed, provided the total under that Part does not exceed $143,171.00.
Dr. HURTADO (Observer, Cuba) recognized that the interpretation of Dr. Soper was correct, in general terms, but as regards the case under study a specific provision had been adopted at Havana authorizing the Director to defray the expenses of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) believed that it was of the utmost importance to ascertain whether there had been an exceeding of authority or an erroneous interpretation on the part of the Executive Committee. As a point of order, he asked the Chairman to state whether or not the Committee had proceeded properly, before a vote was taken on the reconsideration of the topic. He would agree to a reconsideration of the topic if the Chairman recognized that the Executive Committee had exceeded its authority or had acted in error.

The CHAIRMAN declared that he did not have competence to make such a decision. Moreover, personally he felt that the Executive Committee had not acted contrary to any constitutional provision or any resolution in force and, therefore, the decision previously taken was in order, although unnecessary. He asked the other officers of the Meeting if they were in agreement with the proposal of the Representative of Haiti.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) believed that the matter could be resolved by using the phrase "take note of", rather than "approve" the Committee's report, in view of the fact that the Committee on Economies and Decentralization had been instructed to report to the Executive Committee periodically. He supported the proposal of the Representative of Haiti.

The CHAIRMAN called for a vote on the reconsideration of the previous decision on this Topic.

DECISION TAKEN

It was unanimously agreed to reconsider the previous decision.

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) proposed that the Drafting Committee present a new text based on the opinion of the Committee expressed during the present discussion.

The CHAIRMAN proposed that the preamble of Resolution V remain unchanged, that the operative part read as follows: "Resolves: To congratulate the Committee on Economies and Decentralization on its work and to request that it continue its task in the same able manner", and that paragraph 2 of the resolution read by the Secretary be deleted.

Dr. PIERRE-NOEL (Haiti) supported the proposal.
DECISION TAKEN

The new text of Resolution V, as proposed by the Chairman, was unanimously approved.

The SECRETARY then read Resolutions VI, VII, VIII, IX, X and XI, which were put to a vote successively by the CHAIRMAN.

DECISION TAKEN

Resolutions VI, VII, VIII, IX, X and XI were unanimously approved.

The SECRETARY then read Resolution XII (Repayment of Loans to the Rockefeller and Kellogg Foundations).

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) asked whether the loans were to be repaid in full.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) said that, in effect, full repayment was to be made.

DECISION TAKEN

Resolution XII was unanimously approved.

The SECRETARY read Resolutions XIII, XIV, XV and XVI, which were put to a vote successively by the CHAIRMAN.

DECISION TAKEN

Resolutions XIII, XIV, XV and XVI were unanimously approved.

The SECRETARY then read Resolution XVII (Attendance of the American States at the VI World Health Assembly).

Dr. ZOZAYA (Mexico) pointed out that the reference to the "Governments of America" automatically included Canada.

Dr. SOPER (Director, PASB) recalled that the Executive Committee acts as Working Party of the Regional Committee of the World Health Organization and that Canada, as member of the latter organization, has juridical status equal to that of the other countries of America.

The CHAIRMAN then put Resolution XVII to a vote.
DECISION TAKEN

Resolution XVII was unanimously approved.

The SECRETARY read Resolution XVIII, which was put to a vote by the CHAIRMAN.

DECISION TAKEN

Resolution XVIII was unanimously approved.

The Secretary then read Resolution XIX (Votes of Thanks).

Dr. BRAGA (Brazil) explained that the votes of thanks had been prepared by the Drafting Committee, and it was therefore a draft text that was being submitted to the Executive Committee for consideration.

Dr. THOMEN (Dominican Republic) supported the resolution, saying that the text was in conformity with the proposal he had made previously and that it expressed the views of the Executive Committee.

The CHAIRMAN put Resolution XIX to a vote.

DECISION TAKEN

The resolution was unanimously approved.

The CHAIRMAN announced that, as all the resolutions had been approved, the Members of the Executive Committee would be called, in alphabetical order by name of country, to sign the Final Report of the 19th Meeting, as would the Director of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau and the Secretary General of the Bureau, Secretary of the Executive Committee.

The SECRETARY called, in alphabetical order in Spanish, the Representatives of Brazil, Chile, Ecuador, Haiti, Mexico, Panama, and the Dominican Republic, who signed the Final Report. He then invited the Director to sign, and finally added his own signature to the document.

33. CLOSING SPEECH BY THE CHAIRMAN OF THE 19TH MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

The CHAIRMAN said that, before adjourning the session and closing the 19th Meeting of the Executive Committee, he wished to express his deep appreciation for the high honor of having been elected to the office of Chairman. The honor was one for his country and he had accepted on his country's behalf, knowing he was undeserving of it himself. His task of presiding over the discussions and work of the 19th Meeting had been an easy one for in reality he had only to follow the Committee in its delib-
erations and decisions. The participants had been unanimous in their enthusiasm for the work of public health, and in their desire to contribute to the success and progress of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau, as can be seen from the resolutions they adopted. It mattered little, therefore, who presided at the Meeting, for it was the spirit of all those present that guided the Committee in its work. Finally, he wished to express the hope that a spirit equal to that shown at this Meeting would continue to prevail in all international organizations, so that the progress of health would be assured in America and throughout the world.

Dr. THOMÉN (Dominican Republic), on behalf of the Members of the Committee, expressed his warmest congratulations to Dr. Montalván on the able manner in which he had conducted the Meeting. He also expressed the Committee's appreciation to Dr. Soper, to Dr. Bustamante, and to all members of the staff of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau who had taken part in the work of the 19th Meeting of the Executive Committee.

The session was adjourned at 6:05 p.m.
ANNEX I

INDEX TO THE PRECIS MINUTES

PART I: Topics of the Agenda

Page 1

PART II: Other Matters Considered

Page 2
INDEX TO THE PRECIS MINUTES

PART I: TOPICS OF THE AGENDA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic Number</th>
<th>Title and Document References</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Opening by the Chairman of the 18th Meeting of the Executive Committee</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Election of Chairman and Vice-Chairman</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Adoption of the Agenda (CE19/1, Rev. 1)</td>
<td>3,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Proposed Program and Budget of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau for 1954 (CE19/2, CE19/23, Rev. 1)</td>
<td>7,51,59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Report of Working Party I (Program and Budget)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Draft Regulations on the Promotion of Personnel from within the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (Escalafón del Personal) (CE19/9)</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Remuneration of the International Staff Members of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (CE19/8)</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Amendments to the Staff Rules of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (CE19/6)</td>
<td>28,33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization (CE19/13)</td>
<td>13,23,70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>First Report of the Permanent Subcommittee on Buildings and Installations (CE19/11)</td>
<td>26,70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### PART I: TOPICS OF THE AGENDA (Cont'd)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic Number</th>
<th>Title and Document References</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Third Report of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution of the Pan American Sanitary Organization (CE19/15)</td>
<td>9,69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Relations between the Pan American Sanitary Organization and Non-Governmental Organizations (CE19/4)</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Inter-American Medical Congresses (CE19/17)</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Resolution concerning Medical Care, Adopted by the Fifth Conference of American States Members of the International Labor Organization (CE19/3)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Repayment of Loans to the Rockefeller and Kellogg Foundations (CE19/5)</td>
<td>36,73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Status of Quota Contributions (CE19/16)</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Amendments to the Financial Regulations of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau (CE19/7)</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Dates of the 20th and 21st Meetings of the Executive Committee and VII Meeting of the Directing Council (CE19/12)</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Method of Work of the Directing Council (CE19/14)</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PART II: OTHER MATTERS CONSIDERED

Addresses, communications, and votes:

- Closing speech by the Chairman of the 19th Meeting of the Executive Committee 74
- Medical meeting in Richmond, Virginia 43
- Votes of thanks and message to Dr. César Vélez Morán 65
PART II: OTHER MATTERS CONSIDERED (Cont'd)

Order of business

Reports:

Final Report of the 19th Meeting: reading and approval

Oral report by the Director on recent Bureau activities

Working Parties: meetings

World Health Organization:

Attendance of the American States at the Sixth World Health Assembly

Nomination of Dr. M. G. Candau for the post of Director-General of the World Health Organization
ANNEX II

LIST OF DOCUMENTS DISTRIBUTED

CEL9/30 (Eng.)
ANNEX II
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document Number</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Topic Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CE19/0, Rev. 4</td>
<td>List of Documents Distributed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/1, Rev. 1</td>
<td>Draft Agenda, Addendum I and II</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/2</td>
<td>Proposed Program and Budget of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau for 1954</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/3</td>
<td>Resolution Concerning Medical Care Adopted by the Fifth Conference of American States Members of the International Labor Organization</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/4</td>
<td>Relations between the Pan American Sanitary Organization and Non-Governmental Organizations</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/5</td>
<td>Repayment of Loans to the Rockefeller and Kellogg Foundations</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/6</td>
<td>Amendments to the Staff Rules of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/7</td>
<td>Amendments to the Financial Regulations of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/8</td>
<td>Remuneration of the International Staff Members of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/9</td>
<td>Draft Regulations on the Promotion of Personnel from within the Pan American Sanitary Bureau</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/11</td>
<td>First Report of the Permanent Subcommittee on Buildings and Installations</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/12</td>
<td>Dates of the 20th and 21st Meetings of the Executive Committee and VII Meeting of the Directing Council</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document Number</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Topic Number</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/13</td>
<td>Interim Report of the Committee on Economies and Decentralization</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/14</td>
<td>Method of Work of the Directing Council</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/15</td>
<td>Third Report of the Permanent Committee on Revision of the Constitution of the Pan American Sanitary Organization</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/16</td>
<td>Status of Quota Contributions</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/17</td>
<td>Inter-American Medical Congresses</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/18</td>
<td>List of Participants</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/19</td>
<td>Provisional Précis Minutes of the First Plenary Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/20</td>
<td>Provisional Précis Minutes of the Second Plenary Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/21</td>
<td>Provisional Précis Minutes of the Third Plenary Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/22</td>
<td>Provisional Précis Minutes of the Fourth Plenary Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/23, Rev. 1</td>
<td>Report of the Working Party on the Proposed Program and Budget of the Pan American Sanitary Bureau for the Year 1954</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/24</td>
<td>Provisional Précis Minutes of the Fifth Plenary Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/25, Corr. 1</td>
<td>Corrigenda (to above Report)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/26</td>
<td>Provisional Précis Minutes of the Sixth Plenary Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/27</td>
<td>Provisional Précis Minutes of the Seventh Plenary Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Document Number</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/28, Rev. 1</td>
<td>Final Report</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/29</td>
<td>Provisional Précis Minutes of the Eighth Plenary Session</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CE19/30</td>
<td>Definitive Text of the Précis Minutes (This document incorporates Documents CE19/19, CE19/20, CE19/21, CE19/22, CE19/24, CE19/26, CE19/27, and CE19/29, with the corrections made by the Representatives and the necessary editorial changes)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>